DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 394 036 CE 071 392

AUTHOR	Wilson, Valerie; And Others
TITLE	Progress in Partnership: Evaluations of "Education Business Links" and "Teacher Placement."
INSTITUTION	Scottish Council for Research in Education, Edinburgh.
REPORT NO	ISBN-1-86003-023-8; SCRE-RR-73
PUB DATE	96
NOTE	74p.; This report presents the results of two evaluations funded by Scottish Enterprise.
AVAILABLE FROM	Scottish Council for Research in Education, 15 St. John Street, Edinburgh EH8 8JR, Scotland, United Kingdom (7 pounds).
PUB TYPE	Reports - Research/Technical (143)
EDRS PRICE	MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS	Education Work Relationship; *Faculty Development; Foreign Countries; *Partnerships in Education; *Program Effectiveness; Program Evaluation; *School Business Relationship; Vocational Education; Vocational Education Teachers; *Work Experience Programs
IDENTIFIERS	*Scotland

ABSTRACT

This publication reports two evaluations carried out in 1995 that concerned initiatives in Scotland aimed to encourage the further development of links between education and industry. "Focus on Partnership" discusses a study to review the effectiveness of the Education Business Partnerships (EBP) initiative and the resulting policy implications and to suggest how the Teacher Placement Service (TPS) might best be organized in the future. This study included interviews with 11 key informants in business and education, 5 focus group meetings, a mail survey of 18 school board members and 13 EBP managers, and a telephone survey of 7 EBP conveners. These conclusions are reported: EBPs are generally perceived as fulfilling a coordinating function; EBPs have brought education and business closer together; success is at the level of divisionwide rather than school-based initiatives; and local strategies are best developed through an iterative process among Local Enterprise Companies, EBPs, and other partners. Criteria essential to success of a partnership are identified. "Changing Places" reports research that explored the concept of teacher placement and the extent to which it was capable of delivering effective staff development. This study included interviews with 5 key informants, case studies of TPS in 3 regions, 2 focus group meetings, and a Delphi panel of 20 informants. These conclusions are reported: the way teacher placement is conceptualized and operationalized varies greatly; those with personal experience of teacher placement are most positive about its role in staff development; quality placements produce extremely cost-effective curriculum and personal development for teachers; and there is little evidence that placements are integrated into school development planning. Criteria for successful teacher placements are identified. The report contains 24 references, a topic guide for the TPS evaluation, and collated issues from the Delphi group. (YLB)

CE

ED 394 036

Progress in Partnership

Evaluations of *Education Business Links* and *Teacher Placement*

Valerie Wilson
Anne Pirrie
Elizabeth McFall

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL IN **OTHER THAN PAPER COPY** HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

R Wate

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)"

CG071392

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Progress in Partnership

Evaluations of *Education Business Links* and *Teacher Placement*

Valerie Wilson
Anne Pirrie
Elizabeth McFall

The Scottish Council for
Research in Education

SCRE Research Report No 73

ISBN 1 86003 023 8

Copyright © 1996 the Scottish Council for Research in Education

First published 1996

This report presents the results of two evaluations funded by Scottish Enterprise and undertaken by the Scottish Council for Research in Education during 1995.

The views expressed are those of the authors and are not necessarily those of the Scottish Council for Research in Education or Scottish Enterprise.

Printed and bound by the Scottish Council for Research in Education, 15 St John Street, Edinburgh EH8 8JR.

Contents

Page

Preface iv

Abbreviations iii

Part One: Focus on Partnership — An Evaluation of Education Business Partnerships and Options for the Teacher Placement Service in Scotland 1

Part Two: Changing Places — An Evaluation of Teacher Placement in Scotland 27

Abbreviations

CBI:	Confederation of British Industry
CITB:	Construction Industrial Training Board
DTI:	Department of Trade and Industry
EBP:	Education Business Partnerships
EA:	Education Authority
EIL:	Education Industry Links
EILO:	Education Industry Liaison Officer
FE:	Further Education
LEA:	Local Education Authority
LEC:	Local Enterprise Companies
MIS:	Management and Information Studies
SEN:	Special Educational Needs
SME:	Small and Medium-sized Enterprises
SVQs:	Scottish Vocational Qualifications
TPO:	Teacher Placement Organiser
TPS:	Teacher Placement Service
TVEI:	Technical and Vocational Education Initiative
UBI:	Understanding British Industry

Preface

> Our task... now is to devise strategies to deal with the familiarity problem and to empower teachers to challenge the familiarity of schooling. This could be done by insisting that all teachers had periods in other occupations, rather than through the academic study of schools. All the deadening aspects of the occupational culture of teaching would be dispelled by systematic exposure to other occupational cultures. (Delamont, 1992) *Fieldwork in Educational Settings: Methods, Pitfalls and Perspectives.*

This report presents the results of two evaluations — 'Education Business Partnerships' and 'Teacher Placement' — funded by Scottish Enterprise and undertaken by the Scottish Council for Research in Education during 1995. Both review initiatives in Scotland aimed to encourage the further development of links between education and industry and which, *inter alia*, address the possible 'deadening effect' of organisational culture as identified by Delamont.

It is hoped that they will be of interest to a wide audience: teachers, education authorities, policy makers, business people and others wishing to strengthen the developing education/industry links. The underlying message is that we all have much to learn from each other.

We wish to acknowledge the help and co-operation of a number of people: in particular, Hamish Ross and Gordon McVie from Scottish Enterprise who provided access to the world of Education Business Partnerships (EBPs) and the Teacher Placement Service (TPS); Varry Pugh, director of UBI(Scotland), for her helpful comments on our draft report, Peter Glissov, Research Officer in SCRE and Tony Graham, ODS, who undertook some of the interviews.

We are grateful to the managers, members of Local Enterprise Companies (LECs), staff at regional authority education departments, headteachers, teachers, teacher placement agencies, employers, students and school board members who agreed to be interviewed or participated in focus group meetings.

We trust that we have represented their different perceptions adequately.

Part One

Focus on Partnership: An Evaluation of Education Business Partnerships and Options for the Teacher Placement Service in Scotland

Contents of Part 1

		page
	Education Business Partnerships: Executive Summary	3
1	Introduction	5
2	The evaluation in context	6
3	Evaluation questions	9
4	Methodology	10
5	EBPs: co-ordination and coherence?	11
6	EBPs: committed partnerships?	14
7	EBPs: the secrets of success?	16
8	EBPs: resource issues	17
9	The Teacher Placement Service (TPS) in Scotland	18
10	Options for the future management of the TPS	22
11	Conclusions	23
	Notes	24
	References	25

Figures and Tables

Figure 2.1:	Roles of the EBP	6
Figure 2.2:	EBPs: stages of development	7
Figure 3.1:	EBPs in Scotland: the key to success	16
Figure 10.1:	Options for the management of the TPS	22
Table 4.1:	Education Business Partnerships: breakdown of focus group meetings	10
Table 5.1:	EBP Survey of Key Activities	12

Education Business Partnerships in Scotland: Executive Summary

Introduction

In January 1995, a team from the Scottish Council for Research in Education began an evaluation of Education Business Partnerships (EBPs) in Scotland.

The aims of the study were to review the effectiveness of the EBP initiative and the resulting policy implications for Scottish Enterprise and also to suggest how the Teacher Placement Service (TPS) might best be organised in future.

The evaluation was undertaken in three phases:

- Phase 1: individual sensitising interviews with key informants from business and education including members of the Directorate of regional education services
- Phase 2: focus group meetings with EBP managers, members of LECs, senior teachers, college of education lecturers and students
- Phase 3: a questionnaire to School Board members and telephone survey of EBP convenors.

The evaluation had one principal outcome:

- a report, detailing our findings in respect of the interview, focus group and questionnaire data.

Conclusions

Our main conclusions in relation to the Education Business Partnerships initiative are as follows:

- EBPs are generally perceived to be fulfilling a co-ordinating function
- EBPs have brought education and business closer together
- success is at the level of division-wide rather than school-based initiatives which can be linked to local developments and regeneration
- Scottish Enterprise plays a key role in providing a national strategic vision for EBPs
- local strategies are best developed through an iterative process amongst LECs, EBPs and other partners
- EBPs still have to convince more SMEs of the long-term benefits of EIL
- there is still a need to extend the range of businesses involved in EBPs
- there is still a need to increase the involvement of the primary school sector.

Meeting the criteria for success

In order to function effectively, EBPs must fulfil all or most of the criteria outlined. There is evidence from our data that the performance indicators detailed below are in many cases already being achieved.

Education Business Partnerships: the secrets of success:

- *an overarching strategic vision*
- *clear strategic targets expressed in action plans*
- *formal and frequent meetings with agendas for action*
- *a direct impact on the whole curriculum at all stages*
- *designated liaison staff in both education and industry*
- *an emphasis on quality rather than quantity*

The future administration of TPS in Scotland

As far as the future administration the TPS in Scotland is concerned, our main conclusions are as follows:

- A devolved scheme administered at local level is the preferred option
- Management by the EBPs is generally welcomed and is already being piloted in four areas
- UBI(Scotland) should continue to play an important role, especially during the transition phase
- The emphasis should be on the quality of the placement experience
- The TPS must be linked with local developments and regeneration
- The TPS should be incorporated in school development plans and staff development and review

1 Introduction

In January 1995, the Scottish Council for Research in Education was invited to undertake a small-scale qualitative evaluation of Education Business Partnerships (EBPs) and to identify options for the future organisation of the Teacher Placement Service (TPS) in Scotland. The study was commissioned by Scottish Enterprise.

The report

The following report comprises eleven sections, of which this introduction is the first.

- Sections 2 to 7 focus on the EBP initiative.
- In Section 2 we set the current evaluation in context and review the literature in respect of EBPs.
- Section 3 comprises our principal evaluation questions.
- Our methodology is outlined in Section 4.
- In Section 5 we examine whether EBPs are perceived to be fulfilling a co-ordinating role and lending coherence to Education Industry Links (EIL). We also outline what our respondents consider to be the main strengths and weaknesses of the initiative.
- In Section 6 we consider whether EBPs constitute committed, two-way partnerships and examine how any current deficiencies are being addressed.
- Appropriate performance criteria for successful EBPs are identified in Section 7.
- In Section 8 we consider resourcing issues.
- In Section 9 we turn our attention to the Teacher Placement Service (TPS) in Scotland and consider how it might best develop in future.
- In Section 10 we outline the options for the future management of the TPS.
- Section 11 comprises our conclusions.

2 The Evaluation in Context

The EBP initiative was announced by the Secretaries of State for Employment, Education and Science and Trade and Industry on 24 April 1990. EBPs were introduced in Scotland in 1991. One of the primary aims of EBPs was to 'increase the exchange of knowledge, understanding and mutual support between education and business.'[1] EBPs were designed to build upon the successes of the last fifteen years as far as the development of EIL is concerned. The introduction of the Technical and Vocational Education Initiative (TVEI) and Compacts in the mid-1980s both gave considerable impetus to EIL. However, it would be wrong to suggest that such developments are exclusively a feature of recent decades. As Dale (1985) points out:

> The educational history of the past one hundred and fifty years or so has been marked by continuing attempts to tie the educational system more closely to the economy, to make schools serve the needs of industry more closely.

2.1 The role of the EBP

The introduction of EBPs was intended to lend a degree of coherence to existing formal and informal links between industry and education.[2] EBPs occupy the middle ground between the Local Enterprise Companies (LECs) and the Education Authorities (EAs), and draw *inter alia* on the expertise of representatives of both bodies. The involvement of both the LECs and the EAs in the constitution and management of EBPs ensures that they are responsive to local needs and represent some of the key interests. EBPs have a broad remit, encompassing, for example, the organisation and co-ordination of work experience/shadowing/simulation, careers information, enterprise activity, Special Educational Needs (SEN) at a local level, and in some cases the Teacher Placement Service (TPS). In a survey conducted by the Institute of Manpower Studies [3] the roles played by EBPs in England and Wales were identified (see Figure 2.1).

Figure 2.1: Roles of the EBP

- **adviser**: on the setting up of projects, how to obtain funds
- **banker**: providing funds for projects
- **broker**: putting businesses and educational institutions together, facilitating links
- **marketing manager**: assessing the demand and working through partnership agencies (brands) to meet it
- **product developer**: generating ideas for new forms of partnership
- **publicist**: raising awareness, disseminating good practice, celebrating success
- **quality controller**: setting and monitoring standards for partnership activity
- **strategist**: providing a common vision, setting objectives

2.2 EBPs: responding to local needs

As the EBP Prospectus cited above makes clear, 'the specific objectives of each partnership will vary depending upon the needs, resources and culture of the local community.' While all EBPs in Scotland fulfil the roles outlined above, there are clearly differences in emphasis depending on a) local conditions; b) the particular strengths and areas of expertise of the EBP managers; and c) the trend towards strategic level involvement. Some EBPs are more activity-oriented, while others are more concerned with co-ordinating the work of partnership agencies, and yet others are more strategy-oriented. For example, the evaluation of the Lothian EBP conducted by Nolan O'Hagan Consultants (1993) indicates that that EBP is fulfilling a promotional role, a networking role, and a strategic role.

The ways in which Scottish EBPs are constituted reflect the particular circumstances in which they arose. For example, the Lothian EBP was established as part of Lothian Regional Council, and has benefited from the support provided by local councillors. The Lothian EBP thus represents what Turner *et al* (1994) have described as an 'embedded model'.[4] It has been built up on the basis of existing structures and has maintained close links with the EA, sharing the same premises as the advisory service and enjoying in-kind support.[5] It now forms part of the newly-created Careers Company, which has limited company status. There have always been close links between the former Careers Service and the Lothian EBP, as staff from the former were seconded to the latter. The current manager has a background in the Careers Service, and is thus in a strong position to build upon links forged with over 700 local employers. In contrast, the Glasgow EBP is an unincorporated association whose manager has a background in education, industry and enterprise.

2.3 Transcending local needs: a strategic vision?

As Bennett, McCoshan and Walsh (1992) point out, EBPs have their origins in region-based '*ad hoc* [usually 'bolt-on'] initiatives in a few schools'. Similarly, for those involved in the business end of the partnership, EIL, and consequently EBPs, initially tended to develop on an *ad hoc* basis through personal contact. Bennett *et al* (*op. cit.*) identified five levels in the evolution of EBPs. These are shown in Figure 2.2.

Figure 2.2: EBPs: stages of development

Level 1	Ad hoc, fragmented early experience
Level 2	Simple partnership aiming to develop common goals and work together
Level 3	Compact or its equivalent: formal agreement with a few targets for some secondary schools
Level 4	Expanded Compact: formal agreement in many schools with a wider set of targets
Level 5	Full EBP: a committed partnership on both sides involving all schools and colleges, where link activities play a significant part in the learning experience of all young people aged 5-19

Our data would suggest that EBPs in Scotland have in many respects superseded Level 5. Nevertheless, the key personnel remain aware of the need to convince industry, particularly small and medium-sized enterprises, of the full range of benefits, both in the short- and in the long-term, that they can derive from EBPs, and to increase the involvement of the primary sector.

In sum, evidence from the literature would suggest that the hallmarks of a successful 'committed partnership' are *'formal and frequent meetings with action agendas'* (Bennett *et al, op. cit.* p 8). *Clear strategic targets expressed in action plans* are also a *sine qua non* of successful EBPs. According to a CBI-commissioned evaluation study, successful EBPs are those in which *EIL have a direct impact on curriculum materials at all stages and for all subjects*, and enjoy the full support of the EAs. The LECs in Scotland and TECs in England and Wales also play a key role in developing local strategies for EIL. The presence of *designated liaison staff in both education and industry* ensures that EBPs are fully accessible and sustainable.

EBPs in Scotland reflect several of the central elements of the Scottish Enterprise approach to the tasks of generating wealth, creating and improving access to jobs and developing the country's environmental resources. The key elements of this strategic approach are as follows:

- **enabling others to act**
- **partnership/co-provision**
- **leverage**
- **exiting when the job is done**
- **continual investment in staff**
- **more focused priorities** [6]

In addition, the Scottish Enterprise approach is characterised by using the networking principle to link local activities with a national agenda. This is the context in which we identified our evaluation questions, which are detailed in Section 3 below. Before we move on, however, let us summarise the principal roles of EBPs as they are evolving in Scotland:

- **catalyst**
- **strategist**
- **visionary**
- **networker**
- **facilitator**
- **enabler**
- **publicist**
- **marketer.**

3 Evaluation Questions

The overall aim of the evaluation is to consider the policy implications for Scottish Enterprise of the EBP network. Our central evaluation questions are thus as follows:

- Do EBPs effectively co-ordinate and lend coherence to education-industry links?
- How have the various members of the local enterprise network interpreted the EBP initiative?
- What do the EBP partners consider to be the strengths and weaknesses of the network?
- Do EBPs constitute committed, two-way partnerships?
- What are appropriate performance indicators for EBPs?
- Can EBPs be effectively self-resourcing?

In addition, in respect of the TPS, the main question is

- What are the options for the future organisation of the TPS?

4 Methodology

4.1 Individual interviews with key informants

The first phase of the evaluation of the EBP initiative and the TPS in Scotland was based upon eleven in-depth interviews, each lasting approximately one hour. Informants were selected to represent the main interest groups: Scottish Enterprise; the regional education authorities; EBP managers; the LECs; Understanding British Industry (UBI) (Scotland); and Teacher Placement Organisers (TPOs). We sought to achieve a broad cross-section of respondents in order to sensitise the researchers to the main issues.

4.2 Focus group meetings

The second phase of the study, conducted in March 1995, comprised a series of five focus group meetings. These were designed primarily to explore hypotheses emerging from the preliminary interviews and to represent the key groups engaged in education-industry links (EIL). The breakdown of the focus groups is shown in Table 4.1:

Table 4.1: Education Business Partnerships: breakdown of focus group meetings

Group	Composition
Group 1	EBP managers
Group 2	LEC representatives
Group 3	Trainee teachers
Group 4	College lecturers
Group 5	Senior teachers

4.3 Telephone interviews with EBP convenors

The research team also conducted telephone interviews with the convenors of seven Scottish EBPs (the majority of whom represented business interests) in order to obtain their unique perspective on the development of the initiative.

4.4 EBP Organisation Profile Questionnaire

The managers of the thirteen Scottish EBPs received a questionnaire designed to provide data concerning the structure and main activities of each EBP. Eleven completed questionnaires were returned. The main findings as regards the key activities of each EBP are detailed in Table 5.1.

4.5 Questionnaire to School Board members

In addition, a postal questionnaire was distributed to eighteen School Board members in order to canvass the views of parents. Only eight completed returns were received, which is perhaps indicative of the position of EIL in the priorities of this group.

5 EBPs: Co-ordination and Coherence?

There is evidence from the individual interviews, the focus group meetings and the telephone survey of EBP convenors that, although still in a developmental phase, EBPs are perceived to be fulfilling a co-ordinating function and functioning as a 'one-stop shop.' Several respondents considered it important that EBPs maintain a degree of autonomy in their relations with the LECs and EAs if they are to fulfil their role as catalysts and exercise an overarching, co-ordinating function. As one focus group participant put it:

> *[the EBP is] a strategic organisation which can deliver projects which meet the strategic objectives of the funding body.*

There is clearly some tension between this perceived need for autonomy and the fact that at present funding for the EBPs is channelled through the LECs. One respondent referred to the need to make it clear that EBPs were not 'in the LECs' pockets'. This is obviously more difficult in cases where the EBP is situated on LEC premises. In order to achieve a greater degree of autonomy, one EBP had recently moved out of the local LEC's premises. Such a solution is clearly more difficult to implement if the EBP is staffed by secondees from the LEC.

The convenor of one EBP was convinced that it did not constitute another layer of bureaucracy. There had been no 'reinventing the wheel, no duplication of services'. However, one convenor claimed there was still some unclarity about whether the role of the EBP was to 'co-ordinate' or to 'deliver'. Nevertheless, the general consensus was that while remaining responsive to local needs, the EBPs were 'co-ordinating, facilitating bod[ies] in a non-threatening way.' In the words of another EBP convenor, EBPs:

> *helped co-ordinate some of the more disparate activities of education and business...not without pain, there was a degree of reluctance on the part of some players.*

We shall return to the reasons for such reluctance in Section 6 below.

Several respondents (6) consider that the success of EBPs lies in their ability to instigate, but not necessarily administer 'division-wide initiatives rather than school-level initiatives'. 'Skills for success'; 'Positive steps: preparing young people for interviews'; curriculum development initiatives, for example the package *Training for a Changing World*; Compacts; Employeeship; Girls into the World of Work; and Adopt a School were all cited as successful examples of the above. One respondent stressed the necessity of emphasising that EBPs are 'not just another Compact'. They are not a single initiative, but are designed to exercise an overarching, co-ordinating function. The range of activities in which EBPs are engaged is displayed in Table 5.1.

Another respondent (an EBP convenor) underlined the key role of the Scottish Office and Scottish Enterprise in providing strategic vision for the role of EBPs[7] 'if it's not high on their agenda, there's no point in anyone being involved.'

Table 5.1: EBP Survey of Key Activities

EBP Status	School support	Higher and Further Education	Enterprise and Industry	Marketing EBP and EIL	European Initiatives	Job seeking support	Miscellaneous
1. Ayrshire EBP - subsidiary company of LEC	Compact approach Teacher placements	Undergraduate placement scheme	Textile projects	Industrial Awareness Days		Positive steps to recruitment	Multimedia Frontiers of Science and Engineering Skills for success
2. Dumfries and Galloway Enterprise - unincorporated association	Primary school enterprise (MESP) Teacher placement Curriculum enhancement Development of GVQs/SVQs		Plan work experience on employer's premises	EBP network project	Promotion of European projects		Mentoring Project sponsorship New projects
3. Dunbarton Enterprise - informal partnership	Support 24 secondaries in core programme of 12 EBP activities Support Compact in 8 secondaries Manage primary programme based on CREST and European Awareness Introduce Schools Enterprise Programme to primary sector	Partnership work with 2 FE colleges to develop links	Recruit and support new business partners esp. SMEs Work in partnership with LEC to support economic development priorities Develop staff development opportunities for business partners	Work with EBP network to develop and promote EBP activities			Mentoring Student shadowing Preparation for Work
4. Forth Valley EBP - limited company	Industry challenge for primaries Manage and develop Compact Support Young Enterprise and Young Engineers	'On course for success' for FE/HE students to develop personal skills	Support Challenge of Industry conferences Textile awareness project			Job seeking skills project	Student tutoring and mentoring
5. Glasgow EBP - unincorporated association	Compact Teacher placement Young and mini enterprise		Plan work experience on employer's premises	Industry Awareness Days (several)		Mock interviews	Skillseekers support Mentoring Various 'one-off' projects

6. Grampian Education Industry Partnership - unincorporated association	Primary network Teacher placement Compact - Skill match Curriculum Development (MIS)	Student/lecturer placement	Industry groups; re. influence and co-ordination CITB Enterprise	Publicity-Guide for Employers Event management			Internet
7. Lanarkshire EBP - unincorporated association	Primary sector support Secondary sector support	Enterprise/ entrepreneurial activities	Enterprise/ entrepreneurial activities	Marketing EBP and EIL activities	European initiatives		Rural initiatives
8. Lothian EBP - part of Careers Company	Providing expertise and support to schools		Informing and recruiting companies to work with education Running projects (c.30) in various business/education areas	Marketing EIL to companies Producing EIL newsletter Linksline Publicising and developing FutureForce via events etc.			Encouraging co-ordination of EIL activities Becoming EIL 'lead body' in Lothian
9. Renfrewshire EBP - limited company	Attempt to continue links between schools and industry after TVEI and Compact Young and Mini Enterprise 5-14 curriculum development		Joint funder to facilitate the development of innovative partnership activities		European funding application		
10. Scottish Borders Enterprise - informal partnership	Organise Teacher Placements Promote Schools Enterprise Programme Support various EIL activities in 73 primaries Support local school/industry liaison committee		Plan work experience on employer's premises Further work within key sectors of the region; textiles, tourism				
11. Tayside EBP - limited company			Organising forums, seminars, workshops, surveys and studies Support existing initiatives	Produce a newsletter and other relevant publicity material			'A listening role'

6 EBPs: Committed Partnerships?

The convenors of three EBPs were convinced that the initiative had achieved its aim of 'increasing the exchange of **knowledge, understanding and mutual support** between education and business'. Such mutual understanding was considered vital if the economy was to flourish. As one respondent argued, 'if industry doesn't sit down with education it leaves a big, black hole.' All the EBP convenors we interviewed, as well as the managers of particularly successful EBPs, had backgrounds in both education and industry. This fact alone underlines the nature of a committed partnership in the present context.

However, several respondents expressed the view that EBPs still have to convince industry of **the long-term benefits of becoming involved in EIL.** Some were particularly concerned about the failure of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) to contribute to EBPs. Many SMEs are feeling the effects of the recession and are consequently reluctant to commit valuable time and resources to the EBP initiative. In addition, SMEs in rural areas are geographically widely spread, making recruitment to committees difficult. As a focus group member pointed out:

> *...they've got to see it is in their interests, that is where they will contribute, they will contribute increasingly where they see I'm going to get something out of this.*

There is evidence that EBP convenors are accessing their own business networks in order to generate greater interest in EBPs among SMEs in their area. In some areas, Education Industry Liaison Officers (EILOs) were making successful efforts to generate local interest. In addition, initiatives like the Lothian EBP's *FutureForce* publication may prove successful in attracting employers' interest. Other marketing initiatives are necessary in order **to convince business and industry (particularly SMEs)** of the benefits of becoming involved in EIL.

One respondent (an EBP convenor) felt that greater involvement on the part of the Confederation of British Industry (CBI) would draw more small businesses into the EBP initiative.

Several respondents highlighted the importance of **extending the range of businesses/industrial sectors involved in EBPs.** Some considered that there was still a bias in favour of the service sector. However, initiatives such as *Manufacturing in May*, organised by UBI (Scotland) focused on a sector which is central to Scotland's economic development.

There was a general perception that **education is the primary beneficiary of the partnership**, and that secondary schools in particular are most likely to benefit from EIL as fostered by the EBPs. Two EBP convenors were of the opinion that schools had initially viewed involvement with the EBP as a means to get more resources. As one respondent remarked: 'schools are so hard up that they view all initiatives as an opportunity to get more resources.' However, it was generally considered that schools had moved beyond this stage and had begun to identify other benefits, relating primarily to staff development and appraisal and curriculum development. One respondent emphasised that schools must submit

detailed plans in order to receive financial support from the EBP for a particular initiative. Therefore, schools which are involved with EBPs are apprised of their roles and potential benefits. However, several respondents drew attention to **the necessity of increasing the involvement of the primary sector**, although one interviewee expressed the view that progress was being made in this area. **Let's go shopping**, a pack specifically for use in the 5-14 curriculum, had been developed by Ayrshire EBP working in conjunction with a number of major retail companies. It is also interesting to note that in a recent publication [8] the CBI recommends that 'EBPs should set local targets for increasing links so that all schools are involved.' We shall return to this issue when we consider the future of the TPS in Section 10 below.

7 EBPs: The Secrets of Success?

Our data reinforce the criteria identified in Section 2.3 above as being essential for effective EBPs. Our respondents underlined the importance of **clear strategic targets expressed in action plans.** All EBP managers now produce business plans and consider the planning process as an essential means of engaging partners in their activities. Our informants also emphasised the role of **formal and frequent meetings with action agendas.** These were considered at EBP manager level, although one convenor saw the necessity for closer liaison at convenor level. The creation of sub-groups was identified as a means of streamlining planning and activities. One such example was the production of *FutureForce* by the Lothian Marketing sub-group.

In order to be considered a success, EBPs have to have **a direct impact on curriculum materials** at all stages and for all subjects. This objective is facilitated by the presence of **designated liaison staff in both education and industry,** who also ensure the overall cohesion of an initiative whose main rationale is remaining responsive to local needs. As one respondent put it, [the aim is not to] 'achieve a national picture but a mosaic.' Two key informants also put considerable emphasis on a more focused agenda, which would foster **quality rather than quantity** with regard to EIL.

We are now in a position to identify the main criteria for successful EBPs in Scotland. These are summarised in Figure 3.1:

Figure 3.1: EBPs in Scotland: the key to success

Autonomy	of main partners, LECs, Education Authorities and industry
Credibility	direct experience of world of education and industry/business
Established network	ability to work with and through others
Self-resourcing	ability to generate service contracts and in-kind contributions from partners
Added-value	strategy based upon meaningful and timeous local initiatives
Supportive convenor	supported by convenor with developed links to business networks
One-door	an articulated common philosophy rather than a physical concept

8 EBPs: Resource Issues

As we have seen, our respondents expressed broad satisfaction with the concept of the EBP network, and with the way it was evolving locally. The idea of a network is perfectly consistent with Scottish Enterprise's national strategy, which seeks to achieve economic objectives through interlinking networks. The EBP network mirrors this organisational approach.

Several respondents (EBP managers) expressed concern about funding issues and perceived themselves to be 'totally dependent on the LECs.' One respondent expressed the view that EBPs 'should become part of the long-term infrastructure'. The convenor of one EBP felt that those involved were 'managing on a shoestring', and that an undue burden was falling on key individuals within particular EBPs. They had a broad remit and received little support.

As we shall see when we look at the future of the TPS in greater detail, devolving responsibility for that service to the EBPs would effectively constitute **an exit strategy for Scottish Enterprise**, and would give individual EBPs time to adjust to the new climate of raising financial and other resources from entering service agreements with clients.

There are a number of issues which require clarification. The EBPs need to be aware of the distinction between being self-**funding** and **self-resourcing**. Most respondents readily admitted that it would be impossible for them to become self-funding. However, it is well within the capabilities of EBPs to become self-resourcing. EBPs can attain **self-resourcing status** by:

- **agreeing service contracts with the LECs, the EAs and the TPS**
- **receiving in-kind contributions from partners, e.g. in the form of premises, photocopying services, etc.**
- **capitalising on their own expertise and know-how**
- **engaging the expertise and know-how of their partners**

It is possible that Scottish Enterprise may still need to provide **a degree of pump-priming for specific objectives**. One such example might be related to changes in the national curriculum, with specific reference to the place of enterprise in, for example, *Higher Still*.

Partners must be persuaded that **EBPs can add value** to the activities of other partners. The continuing support of all partners is required.

We have already commented upon the centrality of the concept of **leverage** in the overall strategy of Scottish Enterprise (see Section 2.3 above). As the LECs come under increasing pressure to deliver national training targets, the budgets for EBPs may no longer be ring-fenced. In these circumstances, it is important that all those involved in EBPs be made aware of the necessity of generating further success by capitalising on existing achievements.

9 The Teacher Placement Service (TPS) in Scotland

9.1 The TPS: focus on partnership

As Turner *et al, op. cit.* point out, 'a handful of *ad hoc* teacher placements in business and industry have occurred for at least twenty years.' The TPS now aims to offer ten per cent of the education service annually the opportunity to gain some personal experience of the world of industry or business by taking up a short work placement.[9] Benefits to employers who host teacher placements include:

- an opportunity to keep abreast of changes in education
- an opportunity to contribute to a relevant curriculum
- better-informed school-leavers with a greater understanding of the local labour market
- an enhanced image in the local community.

In addition, employers can develop their team-building skills and customer-care services through their involvement in the TPS. These are benefits which accrue to individual firms. As we saw in Section 6 above, EBPs still have to convince industry of the long-term benefits of becoming involved in EIL. And similarly with regard to the TPS, Turner *et al* point out that there is a general perception that education is the main beneficiary. The authors note the absence of managers from industry in schools (*op. cit.*, p 203). The University of Warwick evaluation reports that many teachers felt that their skills were under-utilised by their hosts. The researchers conclude that 'industry is clearly failing to use placement as an opportunity to update itself on current educational issues.' As we shall see below, much progress has since been made to redress these imbalances. In their recent review of education business links[10], the CBI sets the establishment of links 'with all schools by the year 2000' as a target for employers. This should go a long way to alleviate the difficulties of attracting businesses, particularly SMEs, to participate in EBPs and the TPS.

9.2 Organisation and management: what role for EBPs?

At the national level, the TPS is funded by the Employment Department, the Scottish and Welsh Offices, and is managed by UBI, which first became involved by running a pilot teacher placement scheme in summer of 1988. The Regions have service-level agreements with UBI. In the case of Strathclyde, the TPS is managed directly by UBI (Scotland). Scottish Enterprise and Highlands and Islands Enterprise have shared overall responsibility for the TPS since 1991. However, the role of UBI (Scotland) may change as individual schools assume more responsibility for staff development through the appointment of school-based staff development co-ordinators. This change may signal an even greater role for EBPs in the management of the TPS.

At present the TPS is supported by a network of designated co-ordinators. These local placement organisers negotiate individual placements to meet the

specific requirements of the schools and the teachers who volunteer to participate in the scheme. They also arrange pre-placement briefing sessions, which are considered essential for asuccessful placement.[11] In addition, they arrange for representatives from industry and commerce to visit schools, to ensure that both parties gain an insight into the conditions under which the other operates.

The fact that the target number of teacher placements in Lothian Region for 1993/4 was 350 gives some idea of the scale of the scheme. The teacher placement co-ordinators also negotiate a number of 'package deals' aimed at teachers of specific subjects. These packages are supported by agencies such as the Construction Industry Training Board (CITB) which represent a particular employment sector.

By virtue of their unique overview of EIL, the EBPs are singularly well-placed to co-ordinate the TPS, and four are already piloting this new arrangement. Given that the management of resources is being increasingly devolved to schools, there will be an even greater need for approaches to employers to be made through co-ordinating bodies such as EBPs. There is evidence to suggest that senior managers in schools have seized the opportunity to undertake a placement which might enhance their expertise in financial management. [12] It is, of course, possible that the costs of supply cover will reduce the potential for such developments, especially in the primary sector. The imbalance in the uptake of placements between the primary and secondary sectors is an issue which is currently being addressed and where some progress has been made.

In addition, other activities undertaken by EBPs enhance the impact of a teacher placement of short duration. For example, all EBPs recently invested £2000 for the development of a database of curricular resource material for their area. This will serve to overcome some of the shortcomings of pilot teacher placements identified by Brown and Chalmers (1990): *viz.* the adequacy of short placements as far as potential benefits to curriculum development and the production of teaching materials are concerned. [13] UBI (Scotland) has developed the scheme significantly since the pilot phase evaluated by Brown and Chalmers, for example, by involving BP in the development of material for Standard Grade Chemistry. This has ensured that up-to-date industrial chemistry is included in the syllabus. The materials were designed by a working party comprising both teachers and industrial chemists. The national database will facilitate teachers' access to appropriate curriculum development materials and thus offset some of the disadvantages of short teacher placements. Industry also benefits from the more effective distribution network afforded by the database.

9.3 Aims and objectives of the TPS

In as far as they co-ordinate the broad range of existing education-industry links, the EBPs are in a strong position to liaise between both parties, and to publicise the objectives of the TPS in a way which convinces both those in education and industry that they have much to gain from the experience. EBPs can link the TPS to local projects, for example, Glasgow's Year of Architecture and Design 1999, and encourage the development of teaching materials. As far as teachers are concerned, the main objectives of the scheme are as follows:

- to update skills and knowledge
- to enhance economic and industrial understanding

- to inform careers education and guidance
- to ensure that the curriculum is up-to-date and relevant
- to contribute to the production of new teaching materials
- to facilitate the transition from school to work for pupils.[14]

An evaluation study conducted by the University of Warwick for the TPS found that thirty-three per cent of the 204 teachers who completed questionnaires had set 'understanding industry' as their main objective. Despite the brevity of work placements, thirty-one per cent aimed to develop relevant curriculum materials. Ninety-seven per cent of respondents expressed their satisfaction with the placement, and almost seventy per cent felt their placement had been of benefit to the school as a whole. A significant number (40%) reported that school-industry links had been enhanced as a result of their placement. These links generally took the form of visits to schools by industrialists and visits by pupils to the placement company.

In their review of education-business links[15], the CBI (1994) recommends that:

> The training of teachers and heads should include a business placement which should be accredited in line with the standards for the profession developed by an Education Lead Body.

9.4 Perceived weaknesses of the TPS

One perceived weakness of the scheme was that teacher placements rarely had a place in school development plans. This made it difficult for the TPS to embed placements as part of staff development in schools. Similarly, many teachers were unable to capitalise on experiences gained during their placement. The authors comment that 'most of the reasons behind failure to implement action plans would appear to be related to the school culture rather than the placement itself.' (*ibid.*) Many schools lacked appropriate mechanisms through which teachers could share their experience with colleagues.

It should be underlined, however, that the evaluation reflects the scheme as it was two years ago. Things have moved on considerably in the interim. The TPS now emphasises the importance of action planning in its pre-placement literature.

Another perceived weakness of the scheme was that certain sectors, for example retailing, were over-represented. This too has been addressed in the interim: recent quarterly statistics compiled by UBI (Scotland) (1995) show that the uptake of placements in Manufacturing, Public Administration and Defence and Health and Other Services is now greater than in the retail sector. This demonstrates the success of UBI (Scotland)'s strategy of targeting process industries.

9.5 The future of the TPS in Scotland

Our remit was to examine the options for the future organisation of the TPS in Scotland. As part of our initial data collection process, we asked our respondents for their views on the future of the TPS in Scotland. Our methodology was as detailed in Sections 4.1 to 4.5 above. We thus canvassed the opinions of the main interest groups: Scottish Enterprise; the regional education authorities; EBP managers; the LECs; UBI (Scotland); and the TPOs.

As we saw in relation to EBPs in Section 7 above, here too the emphasis is on **quality rather than quantity.** One way of achieving this is to ensure that there are sufficient **high-quality placement opportunities** for those teachers who wish to go on placement. It is also essential to ensure that mechanisms are created to allow teachers to capitalise on what they have gained on placement. And as far as the future of the TPS was concerned, the general preference was for a devolved scheme administered through regional organisers **(a 'one-door' approach at the local level).** The consensus was that the TPS would gain greater coherence through and be most effectively managed by the EBPs. The EBP network was perceived to provide access to local employers and to enable the TPS to achieve its targets. As one LEC respondent put it:

> *...the last thing you want is a completely separate organisation treading over all the same ground as the EBP staff...*

The only question raised was whether all EBPs were sufficiently developed to manage the TPS effectively. It was suggested that there should be a continuing role for UBI (Scotland) during this transitional phase.

The future roles for UBI(Scotland) can be summed up as follows:

- **acting as a co-ordinating body**
- **updating TPOs on national initiatives**
- **collecting and collating monthly and quarterly statistics on placement destinations**
- **offering training to TPOs**
- **developing curriculum support materials**
- **developing management courses in Scotland**

It is not necessarily envisaged that UBI (Scotland) fulfil all these roles itself: for example, it might oversee task forces with designated responsibilities, for example curriculum development.

In several regions, the close working relationship between the TPOs and the EBP has facilitated the development of **'sector' initiatives** aimed at achieving the optimum spread of placements and meeting individual teachers' requirements.

Several respondents stressed that in order to be effective, teacher placements must be linked with **school development plans and staff appraisal schemes.** As one TPO commented: 'schools will not release staff unless they see these linkages.'

In the concluding section of this report, we look at the options for the future management of the TPS in Scotland.

10 Options for the Future Management of the TPS

In Figure 10.1 we outline four main options for the future management of the TPS in Scotland.

Figure 10.1: Options for the management of the TPS

Number	Options
Option 1	**TPS managed centrally** UBI (Scotland has already delegated some of its managed responsibilities. This option would involve a policy U-turn. UBI wants to concentrate its resources on management training and curriculum development.
Option 2	**TPS managed locally** By which agencies? LECs: this is not core business Education: lacks appropriate contacts Careers Service: The Secretary of State has prescribed a role for the service which does not include catering for the primary sector **EBPs: the most appropriate local organisation**
Option 3	**TPS managed by individual schools** Schools do not have the resources or the expertise Staff development officers do not have the necessary contacts to take over the service
Option 4	**TPS put out to tender** Possible disruption of the TPS and unnecessary duplication

11 Conclusions

Our main conclusions in relation to the Education Business Partnerships initiative are as follows:

- EBPs are generally perceived to be fulfilling a co-ordinating function
- EBPs have brought education and business closer together
- success is at the level of division-wide rather than school-based initiatives which can be linked to local developments and regeneration
- Scottish Enterprise plays a key role in providing a national strategic vision for EBPs
- local strategies are best developed through an iterative process amongst LECs, EBPs and other partners
- EBPs still have to convince more SMEs of the long-term benefits of EIL
- there is still a need to extend the range of businesses involved in EBPs
- there is still a need to increase the involvement of the primary school sector

In order to function effectively, EBPs must fulfil all or most of the criteria outlined below.

There is evidence from our data that the performance indicators detailed below are in many cases already being achieved.

EBPs: the secrets of success

- *an overarching strategic vision*
- *clear strategic targets expressed in action plans*
- *formal and frequent meetings with agendas for action*
- *a direct impact on the whole curriculum at all stages*
- *designated liaison staff in both education and industry*
- *an emphasis on quality rather than quantity*

As far as the future administration of the TPS in Scotland is concerned, our main conclusions are as follows:

- a devolved scheme administered at local level is the preferred option
- management by the EBPs is generally welcomed and is already being piloted in four areas
- UBI(Scotland) should continue to play an important role, especially during the transition phase
- the emphasis should be on the quality of the placement experience
- the TPS must be linked with local developments and regeneration
- the TPS should be incorporated in school development plans and staff development and review.

Notes

1. Department of Employment (1990) *Education Business Partnerships Prospectus.*
2. Further examples include Young Enterprise; the BP Schools Link Scheme (introduced in Scotland in 1968); the Compact programme, introduced in Scotland in 1988; the BT link school scheme, which provides grants of up to £1500 for projects related to the current year's priorities. In 1992/3 these were 'economic awareness' and 'the use of IT in the curriculum'. In addition, many schools have built up informal links with local employers through Work Experience for pupils.
3. Cited in Institute of Manpower Studies (1994) *Progress in Partnership.* Follow-up study. National Evaluation of the Education Business Partnership Initiative. Sheffield: Department of Employment, p 5.
4. The other organisational model identified by Turner *et al (1994)* is exemplified by Dunbartonshire EBP, which relies on area committees (four Area Councils).
5. A number of EBPs report that they are now targeting staff in the new unitary authorities.
6. Adapted from Scottish Enterprise (1991) *Strategies for the 1990s,* p 14.
7. Changes in the Scottish Office, *viz* the integration of the Education and Industry Departments, might facilitate this. In a speech at an EBP conference (April 29, 1995), the Minister for Industry at the Scottish Office emphasised the 'need...to sustain and develop links between business and the further education college sector and between industry and higher education.' SOID, News Release, 27 April 1995
8. CBI (1994) *Creating a Learning Community.* London: CBI, p 23.
9. Evidence reported in Turner *et al, op. cit., p20* suggests that primary teachers are not yet as involved in the TPS as secondary staff: 'Placements roughly divide in a ratio of 3:1 secondary to primary. Statistics from UBI (March 1995) show that the division is now 2.5:1.
10. CBI (1994) *op. cit.,* p 23.
11. See, for example, Fraser, D. (1993) and Thompson, P., *Teacher Fellowships at British Telecom,* EIS. April, 1990.
12. Fraser *op. cit.* reports that 'the number of classroom teachers, (undertaking placements) including principal teachers, far exceeded those in management.' (p9). Nevertheless, a significant number of headteachers did undertake a work placement. See also UBI/Teacher Placement Service (nd).
13. However, difficulties relating to cover for teachers even on short placements have been identified (see Turner et al, *op. cit.* , p 22).
14. Brown and Chalmers (1990) question the adequacy of a short placement as far as potential benefits to curriculum development and the production of teaching materials are concerned. However, placements of a few days to a week's duration may suffice to update teachers' knowledge of industry and enhance their economic and industrial understanding.
15. CBI (1994) *op. cit.* p 8. An example of this is found in St Andrew's College, Glasgow, which includes industrial placements for all third year students as an integral part of the BEd course.

References

Bennett, R. J., McCoshan, A. and Walsh, S. (1992) *Education Business Partnerships: the learning so far*, London: Confederation of British Industry

Black, H., Fenwick, N. and Mingard, S. (1992) *Compacts in Scotland. A First Evaluation.* Glasgow: Scottish Enterprise.

Brown, S. and Chalmers, V. (1990) *Teacher Placements in Industry: gaining maximum benefits.* Edinburgh: SCRE (Spotlight no 18).

Confederation of British Industry (CBI) (1994) *Creating a Learning Community. A CBI Review of Education Business Links.* London: CBI.

Dale, R. (1985) *Education, Training and Employment: towards a new vocationalism.* Oxford: Pergamon.

Department of Employment (1990) *Education Business Partnerships Prospectus.*

Fraser, D. (1993) *The Teacher Placement Service in Scotland: an evaluation of Teacher Experience in Three Scottish Regions.* Glasgow: St Andrew's College.

Glasgow Education Business Enterprise (1994) *Realising Potential - together. Annual Report, 1993-4.*

Institute of Manpower Studies (1994) *Progress in Partnership. Follow-up study. National Evaluation of the Education Business Partnership Initiative.* Sheffield: Department of Employment.

Jones, A. (1991) Education business partnerships: a UK perspective. In *Education Today,* vol. 41, no 2, pp 5-11.

Kirkby, K. (1989) Pick your partners: education-industry. In *Education,* vol. 174, no 1, pp 7-8.

Kirkby, K. (1990) Foundation for Education Business partnerships: an introduction to 'Partners for tomorrow's world', *Head Teachers Review,* Winter 1990-1, pp 1-2.

Linksline. Newsletter of the Lothian Education Business Partnership. Issue 9. Autumn 1994.

Linksline. Newsletter of the Lothian Education Business Partnership. Issue 10. Spring 1995.

Lothian Education Business Partnership (1993) *Education Industry Link Activities in Lothian.*

Lothian Education Business Partnership (1994) *Business Plan 1994-5.*

Lothian Education Business Partnership (1995) *FutureForce: a guide to working with education for Lothian employers.*

Lothian Regional Council, Department of Education (1994) *Education/industry Liaison across Lothian. Strategies for Development.*

Lothian Regional Council, Department of Education (1994) *Primary Business.*

Lothian Regional Council, Department of Education (1994) *Building Links.*

Malcolm, H. and Johnstone, M. (1991) *Working Out? A study of the Work Experience Module in secondary schools in Lothian.* Edinburgh: SCRE.

Nolan O'Hagan Consultants (1993) *An Evaluation of the Lothian Education Business Partnership.*

Nolan O'Hagan Consultants (1994) *Evaluation of Forth Valley Compact. A Report to Forth Valley Enterprise.*

Rhys, G. (1992) Making education/business partnerships work, *Economics*, vol. 28, part 4, no 120, pp 167-70.

Robertson, I. (1992) *Schools Industry Liaison and the HIE's Role: keynote address.* Paper presented at the Teacher Placement Conference, Inverness, October 22.

Scottish Enterprise (1991) *Strategies for the 1990s.*

The Scottish Office (1994) *Training for the Future.* Edinburgh: HMSO.

The Scottish Office Education Department (1994) *Interchange no 24. Education-Business Links in Scotland: patterns of partnership.* Edinburgh: SOED.

The Scottish Office Information Directorate. *News Release* 27 April 1995.

Turner, E., Lloyd, J., Stronach, I. and Waterhouse, S. (1994) *Plotting Partnership: education business links in Scotland.* A report prepared for the Scottish Office Education Department. University of Stirling: Department of Education.

UBI/Teacher Placement Service (nd) *Teacher Placement Works.* A summary of an in-depth study of the experiences of 200 teachers on placement in 1992-3, funded by the Employment Department.

Part Two

Changing Places — An Evaluation of Teacher Placement in Scotland

Contents of Part 2

		page
	Teacher Placement Executive Summary	29
1	Introduction	31
2	The evaluation in context	32
3	Evaluation questions	35
4	Methodology	36
5	Teacher Placements: nice work?	38
6	Teacher Placements: beyond the numbers game?	43
7	Teacher Placements: what's in it for me?	46
8	Teacher Placements: keeping the show on the road?	52
9	Conclusions and recommendation	55
	Notes	57
	References	58

Appendix 1: Teacher Placement Service: Topic Guide 60
Appendix 2: Collated issues from Delphi group consultation 62

Figures and Tables

Figure 8.1: Options for the management of TPS 52

Table 4.1: Teacher Placement: breakdown of case studies 36
Table 7.1: The Placement Experience 47

Teacher Placement in Scotland: Executive Summary

Introduction

In August 1995, the Scottish Council for Research in Education began an evaluation of teacher placement in Scotland.

The aims of the research were to explore the concept of teacher placement; the extent to which it is capable of delivering effective staff development and how it articulates with Scottish Enterprise's strategic intent.

The evaluation was undertaken in a number of phases. These included:

- Phase 1: preliminary sensitising interviews with key informants from the Teacher Placement Service (TPS), members of Scottish Enterprise and regional education authority services and also attendance at the annual Scottish TP conference
- Phase 2: three case studies of Teacher Placement in different regions
- Phase 3: consultation with three groups of informants including two focus group meetings and one Delphi group.

The principal outcome of the evaluation is:

- a report, detailing our findings in respect of the interview, case study and group data.

Conclusions

Our main findings in relation to teacher placement are as follows:

- there is great variety in the way teacher placement is conceptualised and operationalised throughout Scotland
- the concept of teacher placement has changed since its introduction in 1988 and continues to develop in response to local needs and circumstances
- UBI (Scotland) has played a crucial role ensuring that the concept developed and best practice were disseminated
- those who have personal experience of teacher placement are most positive about its role in staff development
- quality placements produce extremely cost-effective curriculum and personal development for teachers
- there has been a growth in the number of primary teachers utilising placements often related to 5-14 developments
- there is little evidence that placements are integrated into school development planning
- more small to medium sized companies must be convinced of the benefits of placements to host organisations
- pump-priming funding from Scottish Enterprise plus added-value from

education authorities have resulted in a growth in placements but targets still present problems

- a number of imminent changes is raising concern for the future of Teacher Placement.

Quality placement
We found that quality placements demonstrate some or all of the following.

Successful teacher placements:

- ***are flexible and responsive***
- ***based upon clearly identified staff development needs***
- ***include a range of teaching and non-teaching staff***
- ***articulate with schools' targets/priority areas***
- ***involve teachers in the process of identifying and planning their own placements***
- ***agree objectives with host organisations***
- ***benefit both education and business***
- ***encourage the development of longer-term relationships between education and business***

Recommendations
Our main recommendations are that:

- staff development can be delivered efficaciously through Teacher Placement and the Service should be continued
- a devolved service would appear to be the most effective way of organising teacher placements
- the organisation of placements at school level may not be possible without the aid of a co-ordinating service
- transitional arrangements for both funding (Scottish Enterprise) and advice (UBI, Scotland) are required if teacher placements are to survive this current period of multiple innovation.

1 Introduction

> Two nations; between whom there is no intercourse and no sympathy; who are as ignorant of each other's habits, thoughts and feelings, as if they were dwellers in different zones, or inhabitants of different planets; who are formed by a different breeding, and fed by different food, and ordered by different manners... Benjamin Disraeli: *Sybil, or Two Nations*

> Even this warning did not prepare Robyn for the shock of the foundry. They crossed the yard, where hulks of obsolete machinery crouched, bleeding rust into their blankets of snow, and entered a large building with a high vaulted roof hidden in gloom. The space rang with the most barbaric noise Robyn had ever experienced. ...The floor was covered with a black substance ...the air reeked with a sulphurous, resinous smell, and a fine drizzle of black dust fell on their heads...To Robyn's eye it resembled nothing so much as a medieval painting of hell. David Lodge: *Nice Work*

In August 1995, the Scottish Council for Research in Education was commissioned to undertake a small-scale qualitative evaluation of Teacher Placement (TP) in Scotland paying particular attention to the development of the concept and its efficacy. The study was funded by Scottish Enterprise.

The report

The following report comprises nine sections, of which this introduction is the first. Sections 2 to 8 focus on the concept of Teacher Placement.

- In section 2 we set the current evaluation in context and review some of the issues arising from previous evaluations.
- Section 3 comprises our principal evaluation questions.
- Our methodology is outlined in Section 4.
- In Section 5 we explore the history of Teacher Placement and its role in linking education and industry/business. We also indicate the strengths and weaknesses of the initiative which other researchers have identified.
- In Section 6 we describe how the concept of Teacher Placement has developed and what our respondents perceive to be examples of good practice.
- How industry/business benefits from the initiative is explored in Section 7.
- In Section 8 we consider the implications of proposed changes for future placements.
- In Section 9 we turn to Scottish Enterprise's organisational strategy against which we consider the findings of this evaluation. Finally, we suggest ways in which Teacher Placement may be developed to ensure maximum benefits for both education and industry/business.

2 The Evaluation in Context

2.1 Bringing education and industry together

As Turner *et al* (1994) point out, 'a handful of *ad hoc* teacher placements in business and industry have occurred for at least twenty years'. Education and business have been perceived as two separate worlds, analogous to Disraeli's two nations quoted above, each with its own tribal behaviour, values, language and historical antecedents. But as Dale (1985) argues:

> The educational history of the past one hundred and fifty years or so has been marked by continuing attempts to tie the educational system more closely to the economy, to make schools serve the needs of industry more closely.

The introduction of the Technical and Vocational Initiative (TVEI) in the mid-1980s gave considerable impetus to education industry links. The programme provided not only additional resources, with which up-to-date equipment could be purchased, but also an underpinning philosophy. Schools were encouraged to seek ways of increasing their knowledge and understanding of industry and business and incorporate these changes into the curriculum.

Under the banner of education industry links numerous initiatives were introduced which aimed to bring the two worlds closer together.[1] Some researchers (Turner *et al, op. cit.)* have identified a possible 'carousel effect' whereby programmes with similar aims but different names are re-cycled. Clearly, a variety of programmes has been introduced and we found evidence (Wilson *et al,* 1995) that although most were familiar with the concept of education industry links, some respondents in both education and industry could not differentiate between individual programmes.

The plethora of programmes and the need for co-ordination have been recognised. The introduction of Education Business Partnerships in Scotland in 1991 was designed to build upon the successes of the last 15 years of developments in education industry links. In our earlier evaluation (*ibid.*), we argued that EBPs had the potential to bring coherence to existing formal and informal links between industry and education. There is evidence that EBPs occupy the middle ground between Local Enterprise Companies (LECs) and Education Authorities (EAs) and draw *inter alia* on the expertise of representatives of both bodies. At that time (May 1995), some EBPs were already assuming responsibility for organising the Teacher Placement Service. By using their extensive network of contacts in industry, EBPs appeared best placed to offer a range and variety of placement opportunities to teachers within their local areas.

It has been suggested that many teachers currently working within schools have followed a traditional route into teaching, moving from school through university or college of education to school again. In England and Wales, a survey conducted by the Department of Education and Science (DES, 1986) concluded that 'many (teachers) enter the teaching profession straight from higher education without much practical knowledge of working conditions in industry, or a proper understanding of its role or requirements'.

In contrast, Jamieson (1985) in an evaluation of the Schools Council Industry Project estimated that 41% of his sample[2] had worked in industry or commerce for more than one year. In spite of this, Cavanagh (1991) concludes from a study of TPS in Scotland that 'the view of the inadequacy of the teacher prevailed, however and prevails' . This inadequacy model, it is argued, may result not so much from verifiable gaps in teachers' knowledge of industry, some teachers undoubtedly do have considerable industrial experience, but from the fact that this often goes unnoticed in day to day teaching activities. (*ibid.*) We shall return to this point in a later section when considering the efficacy of placements.

From our own data, as we shall see, the picture is not clear-cut. Whilst students currently in teacher training in a Scottish college of education indicated that they already had wider industrial experiences, teachers who participated in the case studies lacked direct experience of industry. The majority of teachers, may still be disadvantaged when it comes to preparing students for a workplace ethos; knowledge and ethics of which they are largely unfamiliar. In addition, patterns of work are changing dramatically, as are the competences required of a modern labour force. If teachers are to make a valid contribution to the personal and social development of their students, they must keep abreast of changes in the labour market in Scotland: the growth of the service sector; the decline in the number of unskilled jobs; the increasing importance of part-time and flexible working patterns; opportunities within multi-national companies with their disparate cultural assumptions and challenges to social and gender stereotyping in the workplace. A real understanding of, and up-dating on, these issues are some of the benefits which may accrue from effective teacher placements.

2.2 Educational change

An examination of the concept of teacher placement must be placed not only in the context of changes outwith teaching but also within a context of multiple changes which have occurred within education. Throughout the 1990s, schools in Scotland have been required to implement a number of major initiatives - many of which are still on-going.

Recent research by the Scottish Council for Research in Education (Harlen & Malcolm, 1995) indicates that the 5-14 Curriculum Guidelines have only been partly implemented: much remains to be achieved. Additionally, major managerial changes are taking place within both primary and secondary schools. Most schools will be expected to operate Devolved School Management by April, 1996, except very small schools for which the deadline has been extended to 1998. School development planning, the use of performance indicators and staff development and appraisal are three other management initiatives which have been launched. How these affect school-effectiveness is the subject of a major Scottish Office Education and Industry Department research project (McBeath & Mortimer). One of the SOEID's current research priorities is the evaluation of these initiatives in small schools - defined as those with teaching headteachers. Clearly, the duality of this role is an area of concern and one we shall return to when we consider the evidence from our respondents.

2.3 Managing change

From the above we see that both sectors, education and industry, have experienced radical changes. While it would be erroneous to assume that organisational change is a linear process, earlier work by Lewin (1951) provides a helpful model of change as a process of 'unfreezing', moving and 'refreezing' an organisation. Significantly, he identifies the development of vision as a crucial step which many organisations neglect. Major companies, for example Shell UK, have utilised 'scenario building' as one way of envisioning the future and developing a sense of 'ownership' among employees. The relevance of these, and other, managerial skills to schools and how teachers develop them through placements will be discussed later.

In sum, Teacher Placement has been informed by a number of requirements. These include the need to:

- ensure that education and industry are not two discrete worlds
- inform the school curriculum with relevant up-to-date practices from industry
- provide industry with knowledge of current developments in education
- continuously manage the interface between these two sectors so that both may benefit.

All this is taking place against a backdrop of curricular and management changes in education and also structural changes in the labour market. This is the context in which we have identified our evaluation questions, which are detailed in Section 3.

3 Evaluation Questions

The overall aim of the evaluation is to consider the efficacy of Teacher Placement within the context of Scottish Enterprise's strategy to improve Scotland's competitiveness through the continuing development of a skilled workforce.

Our specific evaluation questions are as follows:

- Is the concept of Teacher Placement logically consistent, sound and robust?
- Does Teacher Placement contribute to teachers' professional and personal development?
- Is Teacher Placement integrated into school development planning and staff development strategies?
- What impact does Teacher Placement have on practices within schools?
- What impact does Teacher Placement have on host organisations?
- How feasible are reciprocal placements between education and business?
- Is Teacher Placement effective and how does it articulate with Scottish Enterprise's overall strategy?

These questions were addressed by deploying the methodology outlined in the following section.

4 Methodology

4.1 Individual interviews and preliminary visits

The first phase of the evaluation was based upon a combination of interviews, meetings and conferences with key informants. Five in-depth interviews each lasting approximately one hour were conducted. Members of the research team also attended the 1995 Annual Conference of Teacher Placement Organisers in Scotland and met with representatives from Scottish Enterprise and the EBP network. Informants were selected to represent the main interest groups: Scottish Enterprise; regional education authorities; Understanding British Industry (Scotland); Teacher Placement Organisers and host organisations in Scottish industry. We sought to interview a broad cross-section of respondents in order to sensitise the researchers to the respondents' perceptions of the main issues. An example of the Topic Guide used for these interviews is given in Appendix 1.

4.2 Case studies

The second phase of the evaluation conducted during October/November 1995, comprised a series of three case studies (see Table 4.1 below)

Table 4.1: Teacher Placement: breakdown of case studies

Case	Location	Activities
Study 1	urban/rural region	• interview with TPO • interview with production assistant in independent television production company • interview with newspaper personnel director • interview with rural secondary teacher who had been on placement • interview with urban secondary teacher who had not been on placement
Study 2	rural region	• interview with TPO • interview with manager of private weather forecasting company • interview with curator of mining museum • interview with primary teacher who had been abroad on placement • interview with primary teacher who had been on two placements • attendance at placement day with group of primary teachers
Study 3	island region	• interview with Assistant Director of Education • interview with TPO • interview with Commercial Manager of local newspaper • interview the Museum Education Officer who had been on placement • interview with primary assistant headteacher who had been on placement • interview with headteacher of a small primary school

Each case study was based upon a Scottish region and included a predominantly rural area, an island authority and a region serving both urban and rural populations. The case studies were designed to explore hypotheses emerging from the preliminary interviews and also to provide illuminative evidence of how Teacher Placement developed in disparate locations. Locations within the Central Belt were eschewed, partly because this area has been well-researched,[3] but also in order to seek evidence of developments which responded to local circumstances. The breakdown of activities within each case study is shown in Table 4.1 on page 6.

4.3 Validation stage

Emerging issues from the literature, individual interviews and case studies were validated with groups of other respondents. These included groups of: trainee teachers; lecturers in a college of education; and managers of Education Business Partnerships. Finally, twenty informants including people with knowledge of education/industry links, representatives of teachers' unions and employers' federations were consulted Delphi style.[4] A summary of the issues collated from the Delphi group consultation can be found in Appendix 2.

The Delphi group's responses broadly support our findings. Some respondents highlighted individual differences. For example, one respondent reported that far from being underdeveloped, policies to enable schools to take full advantage of the placement were 'fully integrated with computerised staff development mangagement system'. Such examples however may be inevitable given the disparate backgrounds of the respondents and actual variations in the way the scheme operates in different regions. A number of respondents declined to comment on certain findings citing a lack of experience in that particular area. Comments made then, reflect both different areas of expertise of the respondents and different local priorities rather than widely shared disagreements with specific findings.

5 Teacher Placements: Nice Work?

5.1 Organisation and management of teacher placement

There is no evidence that the horror expressed by David Lodge's (1988) central character, a university lecturer on placement in an iron foundry, in *Nice Work* reported at the beginning of this report, is endorsed by Scottish teachers. On the contrary those who have been on placement report overwhelmingly positive experiences. This is a conclusion which one of the authors of this report can support from personal experience of a secondment to industry. [5]

As previously noted attempts to bring together the two worlds of education and industry are far from new.[6] But these earlier attempts to place teachers in industry were largely **informal, localised** and **lacked national co-ordination**. In 1987, UBI was encouraged to establish a National Centre for the Industrial Secondment of Teachers. Additional support for the concept was provided by the White Paper (DTI, 1988). At the national level, the TPS was funded by the Employment Department, the Scottish and Welsh Offices, and was managed by UBI, which first became involved by running pilot teacher placement schemes in summer 1988.

In Scotland, finance for TPS was channelled from the Scottish Office to Scottish Enterprise which, since 1991, has shared overall responsibility for the Service with Highlands and Islands Enterprise. UBI (Scotland) exercised a **co-ordinating role** for the management of the Service and also held service level agreements with Regions. At the local level, the Service was supported by a network of designated co-ordinators, often education authority employees on secondment from schools or the Careers Service. Administrative arrangements tended to vary according to the location but usually included an element of **value-added** from education authorities in whose premises teacher placement organisers were sited. With the advent of cost-centred budgets and the imminent re-organisation of Local Government in Scotland, this can no longer be assumed. We shall return to this point in Section 9.

Local placement organisers negotiate individual placements to meet specific **requirements of the schools and the teachers** who volunteer to participate in the scheme. Although there is now evidence that some, at least, are encouraging teachers to negotiate their own placements. Teacher Placement Organisers also arrange pre-placement briefing sessions and debriefing reports to encourage follow-up activities. These, our evidence suggests, are considered essential if placements are to achieve their objectives. In addition, organisers arrange for representatives from industry to visit school, to ensure that both parties gain an insight into the conditions in which each operates. Our current research indicates that there are significant differences not only in the way teacher placements are organised but also in the background experiences and philosophy of individual placement organisers. This affects the way placement is conceptualised and implemented.

Some Teacher Placement Organisers, clearly have very varied career experiences, including work in both industry and education; others have a more focused career path, for example as a teacher or careers officer. The fundamental nature of the job is to sit Janus-like on the **interface between two sectors,** education and industry. Therefore to have experienced both provides a unique advantage. This is not to imply that those with less varied experiences necessarily provide an inferior service: much also depends on the energy and attitude of Placement Organisers. Some of the most innovative 'package deal' type placements have been arranged by TPOs who have experience of the Careers Service and local knowledge of employers.[7]

5.2 Aims and objectives of Teacher Placements

As far as teachers are concerned the main objectives of Teacher Placement are as follows:

- to update skills and knowledge
- to enhance economic and industrial understanding
- to inform careers education and guidance
- to ensure that the curriculum is up-to-date and relevant
- to contribute to the production of new teaching materials
- to facilitate the transition from school to work for pupils.

It is a **multifaceted concept.**

An evaluation study conducted by the University of Warwick (1991) for the TPS in England and Wales found that thirty-three per cent of the 204 teachers who completed questionnaires had set 'understanding industry' as their main objective. Despite the brevity of work placements, thirty-one per cent aimed to develop relevant curriculum materials. Ninety-seven per cent of respondents expressed their satisfaction with the placement, and almost seventy per cent felt their placements had been of benefit to the school as a whole. A significant number (40%) reported that school-industry links had been enhanced as a result of their placement. These follow-up links generally took the form of visits to schools by industrialists and visits by pupils to the placement company.

More recent figures from Scotland (UBI, Scotland, 1995) highlight the importance which teachers place on curriculum development as an outcome from Teacher Placement. A total of 2671 placements from education to industry took place in 1994/5; of which the majority (58%) indicated the curriculum as their primary objective. Fifteen per cent were looking for placements related to management, fourteen per cent expressed more general objectives and thirteen per cent wished to study transition from school to work.

The centrality of curriculum development is amply demonstrated in the reports and teaching materials which emanate from teacher placements. The Education Business Partnership in Lothian have, since 1991, produced a periodically updated directory which records how teachers have utilised their placement experiences for curriculum development purposes. Two specific examples record primary teachers who visited manufacturing environments *viz.* glass and brick making, and integrated these into their teaching of environmental studies in the 5-14 Scheme. This is particularly important because as recent research from SCRE has demonstrated (Harlen, Holroyd & Bryne, 1995), many

primary school teachers do not have a sufficient grasp of science concepts to implement fully the national guidelines.

From our own study, we identified placements which were very closely linked to curriculum development, not only the production of teaching materials but also future activities for pupils. For example, teachers who visited local newspapers were apprised of journalism and able to encourage pupils to write about local events. In one case, a teacher placement culminated in the production of a newspaper, the *Term-Time Express*, by primary pupils.

Additionally, we identified collaborative activities between education and industry which led to the development of significant resources. Two resource packs in particular, *Let's Go Shopping* and *Let's Make it in Scotland*, are examples of mutual partnerships with occupational sectors. Each was designed specifically to articulate with the 5-14 Guidelines and has received endorsement from HM Inspectors of Schools. Significantly, the latter pack addresses manufacturing - an area which primary teachers may know little about - and one which has become increasingly popular as a placement venue. In 1994/5, 322 placements took place in manufacturing (the largest single category) and an additional 122 in metal manufacturing and chemicals. The lack of interest in the manufacturing sector identified in earlier evaluations (Fraser, 1993) has now disappeared and was symbolised by the Manufacturing in May awards ceremony hosted by IBM earlier this year. [8]

5.3 Perceived weaknesses

Previous evaluations conducted within Scotland (Brown and Chalmers, 1990 and Fraser, *op. cit.*) identified some of the perceived weaknesses of the concept and application of teacher placement. Brown and Chalmers, (*op. cit.*) question the adequacy of short placements as far as potential benefits to curriculum development and the production of teaching materials. They argue that placements of a few days duration may suffice to update teachers' knowledge of industry and to enhance their economic and industrial understanding, but provide insufficient opportunity for the development of materials.

Our evidence would suggest that to a large extent this criticism has been addressed. It is important to acknowledge that the first evaluation was conducted of pilot teacher placements: much has been learnt and changed since that date. The hegemony of the five-day teacher placement has given way to far **more flexible arrangements** which include shorter, **more focused** 'package deals' **firmly tied in to school objectives** and longer-term follow-up activities. A placement at the Royal Mail, for example, has now led to wider benefits. These benefits extend beyond staff development opportunities for the secondary school and its cluster primary schools, and have been cascaded via the Region's Management Development Unit to which the teacher has recently been seconded. This demonstrates the **multiplier effect** of placements.

5.4 A developmental concept

As we indicated above (Section 5.3) Teacher Placement is very much a **developmental concept**: it continues both to develop and develop others. Originally, it was envisaged as a five day block placement for teachers from education to visit industry and business. In fact, one of the earlier beneficiaries

was a college of education in which we conducted a focus group meeting. Staff reported that six lecturers undertook two five-day placements in large organisations during 1989. One recalled that:

> *...just at that time education was beginning to plan how to train the managers in schools. The SOED Management Training for Headteachers modules were being developed. It was easy for me in the two placements I went to (Marks & Spencer and British Gas) : we were looking at effectiveness. What struck me as important was how managers used figures at the beginning of each week as indicators. They were able to make comparisons with the same week in different years - the commercial pressure was immediate but they coped and reacted to the pressures. That was new to me.*
>
> Lecturer, M, College of Education,

The development of Teacher Placement demonstrates the best principles of adult learning: **experiential learning** and **relevance to the learner**. We can see from the above quotation how our respondent was able to make connections between what was happening in his own working environment and what he could learn from commercial organisations. He saw the operation of performance indicators at a time when the Scottish Office was introducing indicators in education. The match is clear.

We would argue that Teacher Placement at its best, *viz.* where the perceived **relevance of the experiences, choice of location** and **timing** co-exist, is an extremely effective means of staff development. The effects can be both dramatic and long-term. Our respondents report that not only was their knowledge increased but they felt far more motivated as a consequence. This was especially true in smaller primary schools in rural communities. One headteacher who was planning a second placement, this time abroad, reported that he had been in post for thirteen years and needed ways of keeping himself motivated.

How much further can the concept be developed? Education Business Managers at their network meeting in October suggested that the concept has moved considerably from general business awareness for teachers to **curriculum, personal and management development**. They argue that this has been, in part, a response to the numerous changes in the curriculum. One of the Teacher Placement Organisers perceived it:

> *...(TPS) opens doors which can be kept open. It is often the starting point for longer-term links - a chance to establish a relationship which can continue.*
>
> Teacher Placement Organiser, F.

The challenge facing Teacher Placement Organisers now is how to develop the concept further in response to recent changes in the management of education. Devolved School Management presents both a threat and a challenge. One TPO saw this as:

> *We must now deal more effectively with staff development co-ordinators in schools. Their role is to look around and meet people's needs. There is still a big promotional job to be done, even though the TPS has been running since 1989, there are lots of people who don't know about it. Schools in general don't have contacts with networks. We need to talk more with staff development co-ordinators.*
>
> Teacher Placement Organiser, F

The Education Business Partnership Managers perceived that the future may lie with headteachers.

> *We think it is the most cost-effective method of staff development. It is a concept which has developed. But headteachers might be sitting in their schools and they see a range*

of options and may see Teacher Placement as less effective than specialist subject-based in-service days. Teacher Placements have got to be linked to other activities.

Education Business Partnership Manager, M

5.5 A new name?

A number of our respondents pointed out that the title 'Teacher Placement Service' is an anachronism. Although the majority of participants are teachers, 2177, 80% of the total number in 1994/5 were primary or secondary school teachers, 20% are not classroom teachers. (UBI, 1995) These include: headteachers, teachers in independent schools, education authority officials, advisors, TVEI co-ordinators, staff tutors, careers officers, museum education officers, college of education lecturers and students and further education lecturers. A number of respondents recall very senior education officers going on placement to 'blue chip' companies to **experience strategic planning.**[9] This overcame the absence of sufficiently high level management courses within traditional in-service provision.

Respondents, particularly those heavily involved in the administration and organisation of placements, suggested that a new name should be sought which would avoid the current ambiguity and reflect a wider definition of the concept.

I would like to see something about staff development activity or competence enhancement, something like that, so it relates to what is really about, it is a very short term Teacher Placement and it doesn't really mean anything, what place, where you know and why? ... if you approach a manager, they think it's a teacher coming to take a look around for a week ... if it was couched in the language of development which could be understood on both sides and be relevant on both sides that would help a lot.

Community and Education Liaison Manager, Life Assurance company

Three TPOs echoed these concerns that the label teacher placement might inadvertently contribute to misinterpretation of the concept and conceal the participation of non-teachers in the scheme. These TPOs declined to offer an alternative, citing the difficulty of 'coining a short title' which would effectively encapsulate such a broad concept. However, others proposed the Service be renamed as either **Education Placements** or **Education into Business.** Unfortunately, neither signals the notion of reciprocity. This will be discussed further in Section 7. The concern with nomenclature was generally not shared by those who have participated in placement activities but were not involved with its administration. Of twelve participants from education and business, only three expressed any concern with the name.

The main points to emerge from an examination of the concept of Teacher Placement are:

- **Teacher Placement is both a multifaceted and developmental concept**
- **a variety of ways of conceptualising and operationalising the term have been identified in Scotland**
- **it articulates with the best principles of adult learning: experiential learning and relevance for the learner**
- **the title Teacher Placement is misleading.**

In the next section, we move on to examine examples of practice.

6 Teacher Placements: Beyond the Numbers Game?

6.1 Origins of the target

We have seen earlier in this report that the TPS aims for a target of 10% of teachers on placement each year. A number of respondents talked of the origins of this target. Some suggested that it was 'simply plucked out of the air' by Lord Young when he was Minister at the Department of Trade and Industry. Whether this is myth or reality has become largely irrelevant: it has entered the mythology of Teacher Placement and functions as do all myths *viz.* as stories which people like to hear and desperately want to believe. (McPherson & Raab, 1988)

The reason why a 10% target was imposed may now have been lost but a number of respondents accept that Scottish Enterprise, as a publicly accountable body, must operate with quantitative targets if cost-effectiveness is to be reviewed. However, strong opinions were expressed that the quality of placements should not be sacrificed for quantity. Some TPOs and EBP managers thought that the quality Vs quantity debate was 'wrong-headed'. They argued very strongly that emphasis should be on **flexible quality placements which meet identified needs.** These could utilise a variety of formats: very short placements; group activities; package deals; and management training courses with industrial colleagues, which would per force help an area meet its numerical target. But the primary focus must remain **developmental.**

6.2 Examples of good practice

In other sections of this report we have identified quality as an integral part of a developing teacher placement concept. We now wish to consider in more detail some recent developments which were identified in the case studies. These are offered as exemplars of ways in which the concept has been developed further.

To overcome problems of distance and expense in our island case study, a 'mountain to Mohammed approach' was adopted. The TPO utilised a visit by a BT quality manager to BT staff on the island to arrange a group placement for local teachers on quality. This **'piggy-back' placement** is extremely cost-effective: travel and time are minimised by capitalising opportunistically on expertise and relevance. We would argue that this example of a local solution to local needs and circumstances articulates best with Scottish Enterprise's strategy to work with and through local networks.

Another example of meeting identified needs cost-effectively is the use of **'package deal' placements.** We have identified a number of these. In particular, the Royal Botanical Gardens, Edinburgh, and the Lead Mining Museum, Wanlockhead, have targeted Environmental Studies teachers. The first was over-subscribed and will be repeated, the second is one of a series of group placements

which have taken place at the museum. A health promotion initiative, the 'sex, drugs and rock n' roll programme' provides a two-day package placement, composed of an overview and options, has proved extremely popular. Forty teachers responded and the programme will be repeated.

There are also numerous examples of teachers and others utilising ideas gained on placement to develop creative opportunities for young people. A visit by an education officer to a museum in London, one could argue an expensive placement, has resulted in the development of a very productive longer term relationship. A reciprocal visit by a staff member from the British Museum Japanese section led to an in-service day for local teachers. As a result, a number of schools on the island are now working on Japanese projects using kits provided by the Japanese Festival – thus providing added-value to teacher placement.

A further unanticipated benefit of the placement resulted from the education officer's discovery, whilst at the British Museum, of an unpublished manuscript of a children's story concerning archaeological artefacts discovered on the island. The reopening of the local museum coincided with the launch of the book translated into Gaelic. The publication of the book represented three firsts for the British Museum: it was their first book of children's fiction; their first bilingual launch and the first Gaelic book they had ever published. Clearly, benefits arise from the particular nature and flexibility of teacher placement as a form of staff development. One respondent reflected:

> *I think the teacher has to be focused before he or she goes* [but also] *there's serendipity, where you get chance occurrences or apparently chance occurrences, like the manuscript, I hadn't a clue that was going to be there ...*
>
> Museum Education Officer, M, Case Study 3

A secondary teacher in another region supports the importance of flexibility from his own placement experience:

> *... If I was given a set of objectives then it might not have fitted that situation when I got there, so I think this flexibility is important, certainly I'd be worried if it developed too much on stringent non-flexible lines.*
>
> Secondary Teacher, M, Case Study 1

A further placement by the Education Officer resulted in spin-off benefits. At a visit to the London Science Museum, he witnessed how they organised a sleepover, an American idea whereby children slept in the museum. Children sleep on the floor beside the exhibits, for example a space capsule or a tram, and activities are arranged until late in the evening and from very early the next morning. This idea was developed for special needs children from London and the islands who participated in the first Scottish museum sleepover. This demonstrates the role of informal learning opportunities. However more formal learning opportunities have also resulted, for example the London Science Museum's head of education is due to visit a local school to give a talk on the Internet. The museum officer recognises the co-ordinating role of the TPS.

> *You want to make use of it in the sense that you should do something you would like to do and develop and the Teacher Placement Service offers you that opportunity which you wouldn't otherwise have.*
>
> Museum Education Officer, M, Case Study 3

Other respondents also describe the development of **longer term productive relationships.** A primary head teacher reported how a placement at the Forestry Commission, initially linked to the curriculum topic of trees and forestry management, enabled her to access resources and expertise on subsequent topics, for example, water and bird studies. This has led to the development of a strong continuing relationship between the school and the forestry industry.

To sum up, the main findings from our case studies suggest that:

- teacher placement has been developed in creative ways to reflect local needs and circumstances and generate added-value
- quality of placement experience is perceived to be more important than quantity.

7 Teacher Placements What's in it for Me?

7.1 Benefits for education

It is easy to identify the benefits which individual teachers and schools gain from Teacher Placement. Many of our respondents described very positive experiences of being out on placement. A headteacher of a very small primary school recounts that :

> *The pressures on all headteachers are horrendous, even worse in a small school... My main aim is to give the children the best possible Scottish education but it is physically impossible to take on board all the recent initiatives. That is the way to an early grave. I take a pragmatic approach. I can do so much, I can't do every thing and if some of the paper work is not done, then so be it. The worse scenario is headteachers who can't cope with stress and take early retirement...I go on placement to keep myself enthusiastic, to prevent a closed shop, always looking at opportunities to go out and bring ideas back into the class.*
>
> Headteacher, M, Case Study 3

Another is reported to have described Teacher Placements as:

> *It (Teacher Placement) is the best carrot this donkey has thought worth chasing in twenty years.*
>
> TPO, M, Case Study 3

Interestingly, the CBI recommends that:

> The training of teachers and heads should include a business placement which should be accredited in line with the standards for the profession developed by an Education Lead Body. (CBI, 1994)

This is partly addressed by colleges of education in Scotland which now include an industrial placement as an integral part of a BEd. course.[10]

There are numerous examples of teachers with clearly stated objectives utilising placement opportunities. (Lothian, EBP, *op cit.)* The five teachers/ officers, whom we interviewed in depth about their placements, described positive experiences. Most were characterised by the setting of explicit objectives, either curriculum or management related. However the extent to which they felt able to capitalise on their experiences upon their return to school varied. We summarise their concerns in Table 7.1 opposite.

The support structures have now been developed so that teachers can gain numerous benefits from placements. We would argue that, for many teachers, the scheme works so well, and the benefits are so well documented, that second placement opportunities are sought. Difficulties with the scheme often relate not to the placement experience *per se*, but to the phases preceding and, more commonly, following the placement.

All the teachers in our cases felt that the scheme was probably not all that well understood by the wider education community, except for those who had direct experience of it. There was, however, a perception that this was changing.

> *I think it is clear in the minds of the people who have aspired to use it whether it be clear in the mind of every member of staff I would have to guess not ...*
>
> Teacher, M, Case Study 2

> *I'm talking generally that perhaps teachers don't, in the beginning perhaps they didn't realise just what teacher placement was about but I think now ... teachers are becoming more aware of it.*
>
> Museum Education Officer, M, Case Study 3

Table 7.1: The Placement Experience

	Pre-Placement	Placement	Post-placement
Teacher A, Case Study 1	**Objective:** • develop French linked to introduction of languages in primary schools	One week in M & S, Lille, France **Benefits**: • objective achieved • unanticipated learning: organisational communication and management	Very effective hands-on form of staff development **Concerns**: • disappointed by staff disinterest. *A lot of them don't see what they can get out of going into industry ... there's probably a spark of interest but it's gone because there are too many demands on time*
Teacher B, Case Study 1	**Objectives:** • curricular • increase experience of industry	Experienced a range of 1-5 day placements: Forestry Commission, Trusthouse Forte, Lead Mining Museum **Benefits**: • Varied • Curricular	Long term links established with host organisations **Concerns**: • improve benefits to host organisations • organise reciprocal placements • benefits on personal side, emphasis now on *school directed development*
Teacher C, Case Study 2	**Objective:** • management oriented/ appraisal • increase experience of industry	4 day placement in British Airways **Benefits**: • objectives met	**Concerns** • organise reciprocal placements
Education Officer D, Case Study 3	**Objectives**: • varied: review, conservation, publishing, organisation in larger institution	5 day placement in British Museum Benefits: • all objectives achieved and • wide range of unanticipated benefits	**Long-standing and productive relationship resulted** Concerns: • **clear links/targets needed without being restrictive**
Teacher E, Case Study 3	**Objective:** • curricular (5-14 Environmental Studies) • increase experience of industry	4 day placement in BP Grangemouth **Benefits**: • subject and process clarification from new perspective	**Concerns:** • would set objectives more clearly • organise reciprocal placements • retain curricular emphasis

There is evidence that the dissemination of examples of good practice are beginning to percolate through the education community and understanding of the aims of the scheme is growing. One TPO, (F, Case Study 2) highlighted the role of senior management teams within schools in emphasising the importance of teacher placement.

> *We've become more focused, I think we've become better at disseminating good practice although there are still teachers that have barely ever heard of teacher placement. They say 'Oh what a wonderful idea, why have I never heard of it?' and you think, it's gone into your school!*
>
> TPO, F, Case Study 2

This situation is exacerbated by some headteachers who support Teacher Placement in principle, but in practice did not wish to 'raise false hopes' amongst staff when money to provide cover is simply not available. Where teacher placement, as a staff development option is perused, there is a clear need for mechanisms to ensure that teachers are prepared for the placement. The evidence suggests that these mechanisms, by and large, are now in place.

> *The documentation from TPS, I must say is excellent, very clear and well-presented and shows just how flexible a concept it is.*
>
> Teacher, M, Case Study 2

Other teachers, in Case Study 1, described sequences of pre-placement documentation and briefing meetings which contributed to the success of the placement. A primary teacher, who went to Lille, for example, described a pre-placement visit to a local branch of Marks and Spencer which enabled her to learn first about company systems in English before experiencing the double challenge of a second language in an unfamiliar environment. Preparation systems, on the whole, seem to be in place and working. One teacher, Case Study 3, however, did identify a need for improved personal preparation:

> *'I would certainly set my objectives, a little bit more, a great deal more, clearly.'*

The potential for the school to capitalise on the placement experience is greatest, in the post-placement phase. Yet, it is precisely the phase over which the placed teacher and the placement organiser have least control. Consequently, one of our respondents argued:

> *To an extent it depends on the school, how much support they give the teacher when they go back and how much opportunity there is in teaching to disseminate what their placement experience was like, what the actual outcomes will be and what they are planning to do ... there is still some perception in some instances that it is out of school and away for a wee jolly and it's just not true [but] ... you have no power to tell schools how to disseminate the information.*
>
> TPO, F, Case Study 2

The difficulty here, however, is that by attempting to achieve numerical targets, TPOs may not have time to undertake the necessary follow-up work.[11]

On the whole then, the placement experience is most successful where policies and procedures are in operation to ensure that preparation and debriefing enable the experience to be capitalised upon. There is considerable evidence that the preparation phase is working well but the evidence regarding the post-placement phase is inconclusive. Further action is needed if maximum benefits from placement are to be gained.

We now consider some of the major issues regarding benefits for host organisations in the following section.

7.2 Benefits for industry

Other researchers, (Turner *et al, op. cit.*) identify a general perception that education is the main beneficiary of Teacher Placement. The authors note the absence of managers from industry in schools. (*ibid*, p. 202) Additionally, the University of Warwick evaluation reports that many teachers felt that their skills and knowledge were **under-utilised by their hosts.** The researchers conclude that 'industry is clearly failing to use placement as an opportunity to update itself on current educational issues.' As we shall see below, evidence exists to show that progress has been made to redress this imbalance.

Firstly, statistics quoted at the 1995 Annual TPO Conference indicate that 12,000 contacts from industry to schools lasting more than half a day each were made in 1994.[12] This far exceeds the total number of placements from education to industry - recorded as 2671 for the year 1994/95.[13] In their recent review of education industry links, the CBI (1994) sets the **establishment of links** 'with all schools by the year 2000' as a target for employers. This should go a long way to alleviate the difficulties of attracting businesses, particularly small to medium sized, to host teacher placements.

Secondly, our research has generated examples of companies which are benefiting from hosting placements. It has been suggested that large companies, particularly those with a broad customer base within the community, support teacher placement as part of their marketing and general public awareness raising activities. Certainly, large companies, for example BP, Shell and BT, have given their support to educational enterprise activities. However, small organisations, which include an educational component as part of their core business, can also benefit from placements. In our case studies, we identified symbiotic relationships between teacher placement and, for example, museums, botanical gardens, environmental services, weather services and local history projects. All wished to develop their own educational services for the public and welcomed the teachers' expertise.

There are, however, other employers who know less of the aims of Teacher Placement. One category of employer demonstrates a **sense of altruism.** For example a small media company in Case Study 1 reported that it hosted placements because it wanted to 'give something back to the community': a laudable principle providing it accompanies a **well-thought out placement strategy**. It is no longer sufficient to provide a company tour for teachers - the most common form of placement identified in earlier research. (Fraser, 1993) The aims and objectives now demand a **professional staff development approach.**

Additionally, there were some employers in our case studies who, despite hosting placements, did not have a developed understanding of the aims of the scheme. The commercial manager of a local newspaper commented on a recent teacher placement: 'now nobody really knew what he was in for other than he was just in to see how it was going'. These may be isolated examples, but we suspect that far more marketing of the Service to small to medium sized enterprises is required. Given that the average size of a company in the Scottish

Central Belt is approximately fifty employees, this sector is crucially important to Scottish Enterprise's strategy and should be targeted.

We would argue that it is, perhaps, more difficult but not impossible for industry to identify benefits from placements. Good evidence has been provided (Standard Life, 1995) that employees of host companies may develop competences, such as planning, decision-making and communications, through hosting placements. For a number of years, other companies, for example Marks & Spencer, have recognised the opportunities which involvement with schools offers to their own employees. This is now a well-respected form of staff development for graduate trainees and younger managers.

We suggest that industry can benefit from hosting placements in the following ways:

- **keep abreast of changes in the education system**
- **input into the curriculum**
- **develop competences particularly in younger staff**
- **market their organisation**
- **undertake market research**
- **understand the local labour market**
- **enhance their image in the local community**

7.3 Reciprocal placements?

The notion of reciprocity is problematic. Clearly, schools and commercial companies not only have disparate aims and objectives but also work within very different constraints. Therefore, identical reciprocal arrangements may not be appropriate. However, we have identified some examples of placements in which both partners meet their disparate needs. One such example of a **two-way placement with differentiated benefits** is provided by McIlroy Coates, design studio in Edinburgh and host to a placement from a local secondary school. In that placement the teacher had the opportunity to gain first-hand experience of up-to-date methods in graphics which informed the school's art and design curriculum. Pupils from the upper school visited the design studio, thus multiplying the effects of the placement. In return, McIlroy Coates designers have agreed access to pupils to market test new designs. All parties gain from developing **personal linkages.**

Similarly, teacher placements to both the lead mining museum and the weather forecasting company in Case Study 2 were frequently followed by visits from teachers with pupils. These spin-off visits were highly valued by the placement hosts both for their potential to enable development of the education side of their business and as marketing vehicles. This was articulated by one host organisation as:

> *One of the main aims for us is to receive input directly from the teachers on the product that we are developing here, so teachers have an opportunity to try it out and then whilst its still fresh in their minds we receive their comments about it... We are using them as a marketing tool as well, what they see here they will take back to the schools and the end result that we want out of it is children buying tickets and going through the museum.*
>
> Museum Curator, F, Case Study 2

Examples of reciprocity were described by the Personnel Director of a newspaper in Case Study 1 as **extremely desirable but underdeveloped.** However, he described the outcome of an education/industry link project with schools relating to the 'Higher' in Management and Information Studies. Pupils undertook actual market research to identify how their peers perceived the Saturday edition of the evening newspaper. Such results from education industry links were highly valued but, with one or two notable exceptions (specifically the publication of the *'Term-Time Express'* referred to above in Section 5.2) few tangible benefits to the companies, beyond the publicity and good will generated, have yet arisen directly from teacher placement. One employer reflects:

> *as personnel, I'm having to sell to line managers why they should get involved ... if I can say to them ,what you're going to get out of this is, clearly that's easier for me to do ... if the education side of placement can think a lot harder about what we can contribute to that business and almost* ***sell to me why I need that,*** *rather than, please give me that, then I think the whole thing would work a lot better.*
>
> Personnel Director, M, Case Study 1

It is unlikely, given the disparate needs of education and business, that direct exchanges could be arranged. However, more opportunities for joint learning, such as headteachers occupying infill places on existing management development courses organised by industry, may be one way forward.

In sum, we conclude that the following benefits can be identified:

- **education, mainly through curriculum, personal and managerial development, is the main beneficiary**
- **additional benefits could be derived by embedding Teacher Placement into school development planning**
- **industry/business, especially small to medium sized companies, could benefit more for Teacher Placement**
- **appropriate reciprocal arrangements need to be developed.**

We now consider issues affecting the future development of Teacher Placement.

8 Teacher Placements: Keeping the Show on the Road?

8.1 Organising teacher placements

From our earlier study (see Part One), we outlined four main options for the future management of TPS in Scotland. At that time the evidence indicated that

Figure 8.1: Options for the management of TPS

Option 1	**TPS managed centrally**	by UBI (Scotland)
Option 2	**TPS managed locally**	by either EBPs, LECs, Education Authorities or Careers Service/ Companies
Option 3	**TPS managed at school level**	by school staff development
Option 4	**TPS put out to tender**	to companies or consortia

Option 2 was to be preferred. We argued that Teacher Placement should be linked to local development and regeneration and sited within Education Business Partnerships. We suggested that EBPs, which hold the middle ground between education and business are best placed to capitalise on their local knowledge and contacts. Since then, a number of EBPs have assumed responsibility for Teacher Placement. In fact, some of our respondents assumed that a decision regarding the future organisation of TPS had been taken and were puzzled by the timing of the evaluation of TPS.

This organisation is, however, not the pattern in all regions. In Case Study 3, the TPO described the benefits which accrued from siting Teacher Placement firmly within an education authority. Specifically, he feared that a transfer to an EBP would result in the loss of value-added services provided by the education authority. The TPS would then have to bear the true costs of administrating the service and experience a reduction in the total amount available for placements. This view was also supported by a representative from Highlands and Islands Enterprise which shares with Scottish Enterprise economic development responsibilities within Scotland. Such diverse opinions may be a consequence of disparate size and historical antecedents. We would suggest that it supports our interpretation that the concept is best developed though **locally defined solutions**.

8.2 Resourcing teaching placements

A number of our respondents expressed concerns for the future of TPS if Scottish Enterprise were to withdraw funding; £350,000 in 1995 and £300,000 budgeted for 1996. The coming year is thought to be particularly problematic given the imminent reorganisation of Local Government and the widespread publicity given to predicted budget shortfalls. In addition, whatever the local budget position, devolved management schemes require approximately 80% of the education budget to be devolved to schools. The specific grant scheme may be a

way of providing assistance for payment for teacher cover. The Scottish Office (Circular, 3/1995) encourages education authorities to 'bear in mind opportunities available through the Teacher Placement Service, particularly in the fields of new technology and management'. However recent press releases from the Scottish Office indicate that funding arrangements for the specific grant are about to change. It is assumed that education authorities will concentrate their attention initially on statutory provision, and be either unwilling or unable to assume financial responsibility for Teacher Placement.

The need for overall co-ordination of Teacher Placement is identified by Education Business Managers. They claim that evidence from regions which operated with secondee TPO, show numbers of placements fall without local co-ordination. In some areas finance is already an issue. One TPO reported that:

> *The 'year -on -year' arrangements make it very difficult to plan ahead. We are usually well into the financial year before money comes through. We are in a standstill budget but the targets go up.*
>
> Teacher Placement Organiser, M, Case Study 3

Speaking at the 1995 Annual Conference of Teacher Placement Organisers, a director of education identified Teacher Placement as the cheapest way of linking **staff development and inkind support**. Rather than develop an exit strategy, he proposed that a **'re-entry strategy'** was required. Clearly, many TPOs, are concerned that reduced funding will necessarily lead to a reduction in the number and quality of placements.

Alternatively, it could be argued that Scottish Enterprise's strategic aim is to enable local developments through **pump-priming**. Therefore, no assumption of continuous funding of TPS is implied. If the Service is **valued** and **worth maintaining**, then Scottish Enterprise's withdrawal of ring-fenced money will not deter developments. Some EBP managers even claim that Teacher Placement is so well-embedded that they feel confident that LECs will continue to provide funding even when it is no longer specifically allocated for Teacher Placement. One TPO suggested that:

> *I know it will continue and I know it will continue in the primary sector but with the economic situation that's happening at the moment it will be massively reduced simply because the schools just can't afford to do it* ***unless,*** *as long as, the education department can afford to continue the partnership, and it's not big bucks, it's something like £30,000 that comes in, the Local Enterprise Company are dead keen and they will match all funding but they won't be prepared to be a partner unless the Education Department can afford it ...*
>
> Teacher Placement Organiser, M, Case Study 1

This, however, may not be the case in all LEC areas.

8.3 Parity of esteem

The continuation of Teacher Placement depends not only on resources but also **attitudes and values.** Is it valued as a form of staff development? One TPO argued that:

> *I don't see anything else which can deliver the benefits which placements can deliver. It is very cost-effective but it must have* ***parity of esteem*** *with other forms of staff development.*
>
> Teacher Placement Organiser, M, Case Study 3

This theme is echoed by an Education Business Manager who thinks that Teacher Placement must compete with more traditional forms of staff development. If schools do not value it, and consider it an effective way of influencing teaching and learning, then they will not access it. This is of increasing importance as schools assume responsibility for their staff development budgets. If it is to develop, increasingly Teacher Placement must be linked with school development planning and staff development plans.

8.4 Vision and quality

As we identified in 8.3 quality, *viz.* the ability to affect teaching and learning, must be built into Teacher Placement. To date UBI (Scotland) has performed a **crucial developmental role**: administering the grant; co-ordinating the network of TPOs; marketing to employers; encouraging and disseminating examples of best practice; organising specific initiatives, such as Manufacturing in May; collating statistics and organising the Service on behalf of some regions. Although UBI has intimated that it wishes to change its role, quality assurance will still be required.

We anticipate that a role for UBI (Scotland) may be to:

- act as a national focus for Teacher Placement, disseminating information and updating local organisers
- market education to industry
- provide in-service training and support for TPOs
- develop industry-led higher level management courses in Scotland

The main points from this final section can be summarised as follows:

- **concerns about the future resourcing of Teacher Placement need, in a climate of change, to be addressed**
- **there is a continuing role for both Scottish Enterprise and UBI (Scotland)**
- **vision, parity of esteem and quality are essential ingredients if Teacher Placement is to continue to develop.**

Our conclusions and recommendations follow in Chapter 9.

9 Conclusions and Recommendations

9.1 Conclusions

Our main findings in relation to teacher placement are as follows:

- there is great variety in the way placement is conceptualised and operationalised in different regions
- the concept of teacher placement has changed since its introduction in 1988 and continues to develop in response to local needs and circumstances
- UBI (Scotland) has played a crucial role in ensuring that the concept developed and best practices were disseminated
- those who have personal experience of teacher placement are most positive about its role in staff development
- quality placements produce extremely cost-effective curriculum and personal development effects
- there has been a growth in the number of primary teachers utilising placements often related to 5-14 developments
- there is little evidence that placements are integrated into school development planning or devolved school management
- more small to medium sized companies must be convinced of the benefits of placements to host organisations
- pump-priming funding from Scottish Enterprise plus added-value from education authorities have resulted in a growth in the total number and quality of placements
- a number of imminent changes is raising concern for the future of placements.

Scottish Enterprise is the national agency tasked with stimulating economic development; growth of enterprise; improvement of the environment; creation of jobs and 'to improve and keep up-to-date the skills of the Scottish workforce'. The key elements of its strategic approach are as follows:

Scottish Enterprise Strategy

- developing a strategic approach
- enabling others to act
- working in partnership
- seeking leverage
- exiting when the job is complete
- continual investment in staff development
- focus priorities [14]

Specifically, in the 1994 *'Network Strategy'* document Scottish Enterprise states that it aims to:

> ... work closely with the education system - from schools onwards - to help strengthen and further the enterprise message, and will support linkages between business and education to help align long term demand and supply as well as to assist with the transfer of knowledge.

The funding of Teacher Placement clearly articulates with this aspect of Scottish Enterprise's remit *viz.* to improve the skills of the Scottish workforce. The concept leads directly to improved skills for both teachers and pupils. However, Scottish Enterprise's approach is characterised by working with and through local networks which link the **nationally agreed agenda to local priorities.** Therefore, continuous funding of any initiative is contrary to its espoused way of working and intent to 'exit when the job is complete'.

9.2 Recommendations

Our main recommendations are that:

- staff development can be delivered efficaciously through Teacher Placement, and the Service should be continued
- a devolved service administered at local level would appear to be the most effective way of organising the service and articulates with Scottish Enterprise's national strategy
- the organisation of placements at school level may not be possible without the aid of local co-ordinators: school staff development co-ordinators are too recently in post to assume responsibility for Teacher Placement
- transitional arrangements of both funding (Scottish Enterprise) and advice (UBI, Scotland) are required to support Teacher Placement through a period of multiple change

Notes

1. These programmes included: for example, Mini Enterprise in which pupils organised a business from within the school; Compacts which promised a job or training to pupils who participated in the project; supported study schemes financed by BP; Young Enterprise supported by Shell UK. Additionally, many schools developed links with employers with whom they placed fourth year pupils on Work Experience.
2. Care should be taken in extrapolating from this sample as it likely to include a higher than average proportion of teachers with industrial experience by the very nature of the evaluation topic area.
3. In our earlier evaluation (Part 1), much of the field work was conducted within the Central Belt. To complement that report, we chose to site fieldwork in the more remote regions of Scotland which included one region within the Highland and Islands Enterprise area.
4. The Delphi technique was developed by the Rand Corporation in California in the 1950s as a way of achieving a consensus in areas where opinions were divided. Members, or 'experts' in an area, are consulted as a panel but never actually meet as a group. In this current research, preliminary findings were circulated to the Delphi group which included representatives of the various teachers' unions, consultative committees, statutory bodies and employers' federations.
5. In 1994, one of the authors was seconded from a Business School in a Scottish University to cover a maternity leave in the Personnel Department of a multi-national oil company. The researcher endorses our respondents' perceptions of industry as a positive learning environment for educationalists especially its use of new technology and team working.
6. Cavanagh *(op. cit.)* suggests that secondment of teachers to industry was popularised in the years following the National Productivity Year of 1963.
7. See for example the 'package deals' for teachers of environmental subjects taking place in the Royal Botanical Gardens, Edinburgh, and the Forestry Commission and also local history, in the lead mines in Dumfries and Galloway.
8. UBI(Scotland) launched its Manufacturing in May initiative to highlight the importance of this sector for the Scottish economy. IBM(UK)Ltd hosted an awards ceremony in September, 1995 to recognise creative placements in that sector.
9. The Scottish banks and British Airways have hosted placements for directors of education.
10. See for example, St Andrew's College, Glasgow, which requires all third year trainee teachers to undertake a placement.
11. See for example Cowie L. M. (1994) *The Teacher Placement Service in Grampian, 1991-93* unpublished MEd thesis, Aberdeen: University of Aberdeen in which she reveals that teachers were mainly left to exercise their own discretion as to how placement experiences could be incorporated into their schools.
12. The results of the Scottish schools' census will be published by The Scottish Office in March 1996 and will include details of education/industry links.
13. UBI(Scotland) collates annual statistics for the Teacher Placement Service and submits them to Scottish Enterprise.
14. Adapted from Scottish Enterprise(1991)*Strategies for the 1990s*, p. 14.

References

Anderson J. and Huddleston P. (1994) *Teacher Placement Works*, Oxford: UBI/TPS.

Archbold D. (1995) *Staff Development Opportunities: potential benefits associated with staff participation in education liaison activities*, unpublished report, Edinburgh: Standard Life Assurance Company.

Bennett R. J. and McCoshan A. (1992) *Education Business Partnerships: the learning so far*, London: Confederation British Industry.

Brown S. and Chalmers V. (1990) *Teacher Placements in Industry: Evaluating the pilot Teacher Placement Scheme*, Edinburgh: SCRE.

Cavanagh J. B. (1991) *An Analysis of the Aims and Practice of Teacher Placements in Business, Commerce and Industry in the Context of Post War Education Policy*, unpublished MEd dissertation, Glasgow: University of Glasgow.

Confederation of British Industry (1994) *Creating a learning community: a CBI review of education business links*, London: CBI.

Confederation of British Industry (1995) *Scottish Business Agenda: the promotion of enterprise*, Glasgow: CBI

Croall, J. (1995) Ain't nothing like the real thing, *Times Educational Supplement*, 2 June.

Dale R. (1985) *Education, Training and Employment: towards a new vocationalism*, Oxford: Pergamon.

Disraeli, B.(1993)ed Smith, S. *Sybil or Two Nations*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Fraser, D. (1993) *The Teacher Placement Service in Scotland: an evaluation of teachers' experience in three Scottish regions*, 1989-91, Glasgow: St Andrew's College.

Jamieson I. (1985) (ed.) *Industry in Education*, Longman, p. 161.

Lodge, D. 91992) *Nice Work*. Penguin

Harlen W., Holroyd C. and Bryne M. (1995) *Confidence and Understanding in Teaching Science and Technology in Primary Schools*, Edinburgh: SCRE.

Harlen W. and Malcolm H. (1995) *A National Evaluation of 5-14*, Edinburgh: SCRE.

Lewin, K. (1952) *Field Theory in Social Science: selected theoretical papers*, London: Tavistock Publications Ltd.

Lodge D. (1988) *Nice Work*, London: Penguin Books.

Lothian Education Business Partnership (1995) *Teacher Placement Directory*, Edinburgh and Lothians, Edinburgh: EBP.

McPherson A. and Raab C. (1988) *Governing Education: A Sociology of Policy since 1945*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

McVie, G. (1995) *Trading Places: supporting education business links*, a paper presented to the annual conference of Teacher Placement Organisers, Aberdeen.

Scottish Enterprise (1994) *The Network Strategy* Scottish Enterprise

Scottish Office (1995) Circular No. 3/1995 *Specific Grants for the In-Service Training of Teachers and Community Education Workers: 1995-6*. Edinburgh: Scottish Office

Turner E., Lloyd J., Stronach I. & Waterhouse S. (1994) *Plotting Partnership: education business links in Scotland*, Stirling: University of Stirling Department of Education.

UBI (Scotland) *Manufacturing in May: placement report*, Glasgow: UBI.

Appendices

Appendix 1: Teacher Placement Service: Topic Guide

Appendix 2: Collated issues from Delphi group

Appendix 1: Teacher Placement Service: Topic Guide

Introductions/Scope of the evaluation

As you may know SCRE recently completed an evaluation of Education Business Partnerships in Scotland funded by Scottish Enterprise. That report was presented to the annual meeting of the Teacher Placement Service in Aberdeen in August.

Following on from that report, SCRE have now been commissioned to undertake a study of Teacher Placements. I want to stress that the scope of this current project is:

to explore the **CONCEPT of TEACHER PLACEMENT**

and the extent to which it is capable of meeting staff development needs.

This is **NOT** an evaluation of the current organisation/management of the Teacher Placement Service in general or any particular regional service. Keeping this remit in mind, could we explore your views about teacher placements?

A. Concept of Teacher Placement

Firstly, can we focus on the concept of Teacher Placement?

— What do you understand by the term?
— Is it a clear concept?
— What do you see as the main aims/objectives?
— Are these understood?
— Is the name appropriate?
— If not, what would you suggest?

B. The Practice of Teacher Placements

Can we now move on to look at how you have developed the concept?

— Have you/your region developed your own approach? What are the main features?
— What seems to have worked well?
— Any particular difficulties?
— Has your approach changed/developed since TPS was first launched in 1988? Any unique features?

C. The Future

Looking now to the future, have you any concerns about the concept of teacher placement?

— Is it still relevant? Still an effective option for staff development?
— Any particular problems which you foresee?

Prompts

— funding e.g. possible exit strategy for Scottish Enterprise
— reorganisation of local government
— teacher/school innovation overload
— schools controlling their own budgets through DSM?

D. Additional Information

Any other issues which you would like to raise? If not then perhaps, we could move on.

E. Personal Details

Lastly, may I ask you about your current position?

What is your job title?

What is the nature of your involvement with TPS?

Length of involvement?

Appendix 2: Collated issues from Delphi group

CONFIDENTIAL

SCRE Evaluation of Teacher Placement in Scotland

Below is a list of our research questions and a summary of the main findings. Would you please indicate whether you agree/ disagree and add any additional comments.

1. How useful is teacher placement as a vehicle for staff development?	**Agree**	**Disagree**	**Comments** (including don't know/ mixed)
• teachers who have been on placement regard it as an effective method of staff development	12		
• positive attitudes resulting from placements persist, in contrast to other methods of staff development where the effects may be more short-lived	9	2	1
• the effectiveness of placement for staff development is directly related to the establishment of explicit objectives for curriculum and/or personal development of teachers	12		
• the potential to tailor placements to individual needs is highly rated by participants	11	1	
• unanticipated benefits and longer term relationships between teachers and host organisations may result from placements	12		
2. What policies and procedures exist within the school to enable the school and the teacher to capitalise on placement experiences?			
• individual teachers may not be fully aware of the opportunities for teacher placement	11	1	
• policies and procedures to prepare teachers for placements and to identify objectives have been developed	5	2	5
• procedures to enable teachers to become involved in arranging their own placements exist: these encourage teachers to 'take ownership' of placements	6	1	5
• policies and procedures to enable schools to take full advantage of the placement experiences are underdeveloped	9	1	2
• policies and procedures to link placement and school development planning remain underdeveloped	9	1	2

3. What are the effects of placement on host organisations especially Small to Medium sized Enterprises (SMEs)?	Agree	Disagree	Comments (don't know)
• SME host organisations gain increased awareness and understanding of educational issues by hosting placements	7		4
• beneficial effects on SME host organisations are most evident where their core business includes an educational dimension (eg museum services)	5	5	2
• the impact of placement on SME host organisations is increased through formalised procedures for sharing information regarding the aims and objectives of the placement and organising follow-up visits	10		2
• impact on working practices in host organisations appears negligible	6	1	5
4. Are reciprocal placements feasible?			
• teachers express a desire for a more formalised mechanism to facilitate reciprocal placements	5	2	4
• concern with time and budgetary constraints in host organisations suggest reciprocal placements may be problematic	4	2	2
• development of flexible placement opportunities may encourage reciprocal placement	7		3

5. What recommendations would you make for the future organisation and management of teacher placement?	Comments
• Should there be a target (at present 10% of teachers each year)?	Six thought there should be a target, of these, two thought it should be increased; three thought there should be no target and three had mixed views on the effects of targets.
• Who should fund the service (at present Scottish Enterprise)?	Three thought the service should be nationally funded; two opted for SE/HIE , two for schools/EAs; one for SOEID and three opted for joint national /local funding
• How should the service be organised, ie nationally, locally or school level?	The majority (8) felt the service should be organised locally with national coordination; three opted for local organisation.
• Who should organise the Service (UBI (Scotland), Education Business Partnerships, Education Authorities, careers companies or schools)?	The response here was mixed. Four commented on the need to involve a variety of bodies according to local needs; three opted for EBPs; two for EAs and one for UBI.

Name: .....(optional) Organisation: .....

Please return to SCRE in the SAE.

The Scottish Council for Research in Education

RESEARCH
INFORMATION
EVALUATION
CONSULTANCY
for EDUCATION

BEST COPY AVAILABLE